



## Government Ethics in New Regional Government: A Case of Social Service at Pangandaran District, Indonesia

**Hadirin Suryanegara**, Department of communication, Universitas Singaperbangsa Karawang, Indonesia

**Em**, Department of communication, Universitas Singaperbangsa Karawang, Indonesia

---

**Abstract-** It is important to implement government ethics as a form of citizen hope in order to have a better government. This article is aimed to describe the implementation of governance ethics carried out at the Social Service at Pangandaran Regency, which in fact it is a new autonomous region in Indonesia. The research design used to obtain data was carried out through a qualitative approach with the case study method. The data collection process was carried out through interviews and documentation. Meanwhile, the data analysis technique was used through the stages of reduction, triangulation, and drawing conclusions. The results of the study illustrate the governance ethics is carried out in full by officers who in fact are civil servants and assisting officers in the Pangandaran Regency. Although there are still several obstacles, such as there are still people who are indicated to be detrimental to the country and the recipient of aid that is difficult to find.

**Key words:** government ethics, morals, local government, social services

### I. INTRODUCTION

Ethical rules in government do not grow in a vacuum - they reflect social and political standards of right and wrong (Glor & Greene, 2003). Ethics may only be instrumental, it may only be a means to an end, but it is a necessary means to achieve goals (Thompson, 1992). However, in its development, as this government becomes more professional, there is a need to define the boundaries of their ethical behavior. Because, it is the nature of their authority developing in the era of public value governance, their institutional ethos also requires evaluation (Kleinschmit & Edwards, 2017). In addition, government and society have changed, and performance (performance measurement tools) has taken center stage as citizens expect more and better government for less (Smith, 2007).

In his writings Brumback (1991) says that "it is not an oxymoron to say that ethics need to be institutionalized in government". According to him, even though public service is a form of personal responsibility, work behavior will relate to the fragility of the human heart at work so that the government has a responsibility so that the workplace is more conducive and behaves ethically. Even in this decade, concerns about public service ethics in government have emerged internationally (Doig & Skelcher, 2001). Therefore, without the revival of a virtuous ethical culture, the actualization of good governance will not take effect (Muswaka, 2017).

In several studies it has been suggested that a survey of one element of the government's standard of behavior, called "Abuse of Position for Personal Income", assesses the results, and compares various acquisition strategies to identify high-risk procurements where the abuse of individual positions for personal gain may be more widespread. It also provides a valuable historical summary of government standards of conduct. The study concludes with an assessment of enforcement mechanisms, or their lack thereof, to ensure that government procurement is conducted in a way that is credible and earns public trust (McCampbell & Rood, 1997). In addition, there is a more serious problem, as most unethical behavior is legal, and government ethics programs tend to be more like law enforcement or government programs. Most unethical behavior, whether it is in government or in business, is more ordinary than embarrassing, more than routine responses to routine situations at work. The enemy of ethics, in other words, and the situations we create or discover on our own (Brumback, 1991). It is even further explained that public organizations, conflicts between organizational values, individual morals, legal direction, and community needs can cause deviant behavior within organizational boundaries (Erakovich & Wyman, 2010).

Reflecting on the experience of Bangladesh, the country shows that the level of ethics and morality in public services in Bangladesh is very low. Instead of manifesting the values and virtues of 'good governance', civil servants generally exhibit unethical attitudes and behavior. Corruption in Bangladesh is

endemic, chronic and pervasive. It is clear that political, economic, social, cultural and behavioral factors combine in contributing to corrupt practices and ethical bankruptcy among them (Khan et al., 1995).

In a different way, local governments in England and Wales are subject to the adoption of the Labor government 'new ethical framework' legislation. This involves a statutory code of conduct for board members, local standards committees to promote good practice and external investigative and adjudicative bodies to deal with allegations of misconduct. Prior to this many local authorities had adopted a self-regulatory approach to improve their ethical practice (Doig & Skelcher, 2001). Law is indeed the highest. However, such a structural approach is inadequate without moral governance. The capacity of local communities to act as key players in legitimizing local governance depends on a number of issues, including social capital, available information, and the ability to communicate (Inglehart in Gilman, 2000). The Committee on Standards in Public Life (CSPL) reports 2019 Local Government Ethical Standards provides a detailed review of the ethics of local government in the UK, which aims to highlight best practices and areas for improvement. In doing so, it makes 26 important starting recommendations. Perhaps one of the most important, and most controversial, is a recommendation to allow local governments to suspend democratically elected councilors for up to six months (Rose & Copus, 2020). The world's most comparative reports on governance, accountability, and the rule of law consistently show that the United States has always been among the top 20 countries on corruption control and respect for the rule of law. Four factors are proposed to be very important: democratic principles, procedures and processes; communicating and institutionalizing professional ethical standards; professional leadership training and recruitment roles; and irrationalization of unethical behavior (Fattah, 2011). One of Canada's history of ethical reforms is a good example of the evolution of ethical governance (Glor & Greene, 2003), reforms intended to promote transparency and access to decision-making, more effective anti-corruption legislation, codes of conduct, lists of interests, greater responsibility by political parties, and closer involvement of the police and ombudsmen in investigations (Doig & Skelcher, 2001).

Therefore, there must be preventive measures that not only reduce the burden on law enforcement but also maintain a high level of public trust (Gilman, 2000). Hence, the local government framework stands at the crossroads of the highway and the lowly ethical road. While the low road leads to the compliance path and measurable performance measures, the high road is much more ambitious and leads to a culture of ethical governance (Lawton & Macaulay, 2004). When an employee is allowed to act in an unethical manner, it sends a negative message throughout society. Without a commitment to enforcement, the basis of ethical behavior is shattered (McCampbell & Rood, 1997).

Good governance is an important management process covering a broad spectrum of principles intended to strengthen the relationship between the government and the governed (Muswaka, 2017). Therefore, in this paper, we will describe how the implementation of governance ethics that applies to the newly formed Pangandaran district government in Indonesia, especially the Social Service. This is interesting, considering that Pangandaran Regency has just become an autonomous region with the passing of Law Number 21 of 2012 concerning the Establishment of a New Autonomous Region for Pangandaran Regency and inaugurating the first Pangandaran Regent on April 22, 2013 (<https://dev.pangandarankab.go.id/public/profile>), with a population in 2018 ranging from 379,187 people (Central Bureau of Statistics of Ciamis Regency, 2019). Why do you have to research about government ethics, especially in local government? According to Menzel (1993) this question still has to be answered by ethics studies even in the future in public workplaces.

## II. RESEARCH METHOD

The approach used to obtain data is qualitative. The method used is a case study, because Pangandaran Regency is an area that has just become an autonomous region and became a new district in 2012 which officially inaugurated the first Regent on April 22, 2013. The data collection techniques used was through the interview process and documentation study. The research location is the Social Service of Pangandaran Regency. The total number of informants was 16 people who were in the social service structure, but represented by 2 officers and 59 PKH assisting officers, also represented by two people with an average age of 31-40 years. The documents that can be used as data sources are in the form of regent regulations and document products that are merged through the pangandarankab.go.id page. Meanwhile, the data analysis process was carried out through the stages of data reduction, data triangulation, and drawing conclusions.

### III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Pangandaran Regency was formed based on Law Number 21 of 2012 concerning the Establishment of Pangandaran Regency in West Java Province. The law states that Pangandaran Regency comes from parts of the Ciamis Regency, which consists of: Parigi District, Cijulang District, Cimerak District, Cigugur District, Langkaplancar District, Mangunjaya District, Padaherang District, Kalipucang District, Pangandaran District and Sidamulih District. The capital of Pangandaran Regency is domiciled in Parigi District ([dev.pangandarankab.go.id](http://dev.pangandarankab.go.id)).

Geographically, Pangandaran Regency is at 108 ° 30 "to 108 ° 40" East Longitude and 7 ° 40 "20" to 7050 "20" South Latitude. Seen on a map of West Java, Pangandaran Regency is the most southeast. The northern region is bordered by Ciamis Regency and Tasikmalaya Regency, to the west with Ciamis Regency and Tasikmalaya Regency, to the east with Central Java Province, and to the south with the Indonesian Ocean. The total area of Pangandaran Regency reaches 101,092 Ha (Central Statistics Agency of Ciamis Regency, 2019)

With great potential in the field of tourism, the mission of Pangandaran Regency is "Pangandaran Regency in 2025 becomes a world-class tourism district, a safe and comfortable place to live based on religious norms ([dev.pangandarankab.go.id](http://dev.pangandarankab.go.id)). This mission is embodied in the vision and mission of the government as follows. The vision of the local government is to become "Pangandaran Regency as a world class tourist destination". Furthermore, this vision is manifested in the following missions (1) Realizing accountable, clean and serving governance; (2) Realizing a harmonious spatial planning and controlling spatial use with an environmental perspective; (3) Providing quality infrastructure and facilities; (4) Strengthening the resilience of local wisdom values; (5) Build independent, quality and competitive human resources; and (6) Build a strong, advanced, just and sustainable economy. On the <https://dinsospmd.pangandarankab.go.id/public/profil/visimisi> page, information was obtained that based on a review of the Vision and Mission of the Regional Head of Pangandaran Regency related to the Duties and Functions of the Social Service for Community and Village Empowerment of Pangandaran Regency, namely mission 1 Realizing accountable, clean and serving governance and mission 5 To build independent, quality and competitive human resources and mission 6 To build a strong, advanced, just and sustainable economy. In supporting the first mission and the fifth mission of the Regional Head of Pangandaran Regency, the Social Service for Community and Village Empowerment is supported by three targets, namely (1) Realization of Accountability for Good Performance of Government Agencies; (2) Increasing independent PMKS; and (3) Reducing disparities between regions. This situation illustrates a clear relationship between the community and local public organizations that can build sustainable ethical behavior among local government leaders (Erakovich & Wyman, 2010).

Furthermore, on the <https://dinsospmd.pangandarankab.go.id/public/profil/tupoksi> page, the Social Service, Community and Village Empowerment which was formed based on Perda No. 31 of 2016 as an element implementing Regional Autonomy, has the task of carrying out some of the affairs of Regional Government covers Social affairs and Community and Village Empowerment in accordance with the principles of autonomy and assistance tasks, by carrying out the following functions: (1) Formulating technical policies in accordance with the scope of their duties; (2) To administer part of government affairs and public services in the social, community and village empowerment sectors; (3) Guidance and implementation of tasks in the Social, Community and Village Empowerment Sector; (4) the implementation of other tasks assigned by the Regent in accordance with his duties and functions. The main duties, functions, job descriptions and work procedures of the Social Service, Community and Village Empowerment are further regulated in Pangandaran Regent Regulation Number 56 of 2016 concerning Main Duties, Functions, Job Descriptions and Work Procedures of the Social Service, Community and Village Empowerment This is done as an illustration that law and order in an organization are an ethical focus (Erakovich & Wyman, 2010)

Article 7 paragraph (3) Pangandaran Regent Regulation Number 56 of 2016 concerning Main Duties, Functions, Job Descriptions and Work Procedures of the Social Service, Community and Village Empowerment describes the duties of the section head of social welfare guidance and empowerment, among others, to formulate a work program for the social welfare development section ; compile operational materials and facilitate the activities of the social welfare coaching section; formulation of operational policy materials for disaster management and other social problems; formulating facilitation materials for social welfare efforts through various social assistance programs; tampering with materials for the handling of social assistance facilities; carry out guidance, development and empowerment of

potential sources of social welfare; carry out monitoring, evaluation and reporting. This is evidenced by the increase in life expectancy, recorded from 69.84 years old (2014) to a longer age reaching 70.84 years (2018) (Central Statistics Agency of Ciamis Regency, 2019). This data proves that improved service delivery through the application of good ethics will not only improve performance and reciprocal representation of public services, but will also revive citizen interest and trust in local government institutions (Muswaka, 2017).

This is in line with the view of Erakovich & Wyman (2010) that local government organizations can contribute to governance processes that affect social inclusion and development. In South Korea, strengthening public service ethics in the government includes the following three main actions: The Public Service Ethics Act, the Anti-Corruption Act, and the Graft Filing and False Complaints Act (Suk Kim & Yun, 2017).

This situation is inseparable from the moral inherent in PKH civil servants and social assistants who are in the ranks of the Pangandaran Regency Social Service who uphold government ethics even though they are still new as an autonomous region. This is confirmed by the results of interviews which state that every civil servant and accompanying officer always respects the implementation of human rights. Therefore, in providing services, it is always carried out with full honesty and never complicates service to the community. Eventhough there are still shortcomings, such as not using the measure of appropriateness for people who need services. This is according to Hankivsky (2006) because there is an ethic of care that has been put forward as a normative approach that can expand the human moral realm (Hankivsky, 2006) which adds to our understanding of humans, and in particular, their interconnection, context, experiences and concerns. This description provides an answer that government ethics provides a prerequisite for good public policy making. In this sense, it is more important than any single policy, because all policies depend on it (Thompson, 1992). Thompson explains, what does it mean to say that ethics provides a prerequisite for good governance? First of all, ethical rules, when reasonably designed and reliably enforced, increase the likelihood that officials will make decisions based on the merits of the problem and not on the basis of factors such as personal gain that should not be relevant. What are the responsibilities of government ethics officials? Dennis Thompson argues that such officials need to do more than oversee documents related to ethical laws and enforcement of specific standards and rules. They also have an "educational responsibility" in reminding public officials of their role in American democracy. However, carrying out this "education in democracy" function is difficult because of three paradoxes or misconceptions that interfere with the work of ethics officials. These include misconceptions around the relative importance of ethical issues, conflicts between public and private ethical behavior, and the importance of appearance.

Education greatly influences moral beliefs. Importantly, while the more educated are least likely to be moralizing in favor of a job or 'wealth ethic' and the job of the least favorable status, they can expect to score high on work ethic measures that emphasize preference over morality because their education usually gets them. In addition, the fact that preference plays an important part in measuring work ethic can help explain the difference between theoretical claims of a decline in work ethic and empirical studies that show that it is developing (Dunn, 2013).

The morality around work and work takes the form of what Kelvin and Jarrett (1985) call a "wealth ethic" - avoiding reliance on state benefits. Education obtained both formally and informally, stands out as a major influence in directing respondents away from the 'wealth ethic' beliefs that are instilled in more sophisticated information, question and answer, and moral positions. Education also greatly influences preferences - lower status jobs are generally more valued and voluntary by the less educated (Dunn, 2013).

Government ethics must be watched out for experiencing a slack, namely about the moral strength of individuals to defend the truth and withstand the temptations of office. Although they still strongly adhere to the use of modesty and self-control in providing services and working with professionals, in fact there are a small number of officers who have working relationships with friends, superiors, subordinates for personal and group gain that can harm the state. This is in line with Smith's view that productivity and efficiency issues are at the heart of government performance orientation, but so are accountability and ethics (Smith, 2007). Therefore, it is important to examine some of the specific job duties and responsibilities associated with official ethics (Smith, 2003). Adopting a culture of high ethical character in local government institutions can be seen as an appropriate deterrent that can ensure the permanent eradication of bad administrative practices while ensuring the effective enforcement of good governance

practices. This will not only restore a sense of local identity, trust, and citizen ownership to local cities, but will also offer a framework within which city-minded city-dwellers can take over city business taking into account the virtuous ethical traits that will ensure the effect of the application of the principles of good governance (Muswaka, 2017).

In terms of service, both civil servants and assistants can provide legal certainty and order in providing services to the community. According to them, this is a form of using the principle of public interest, the principle of openness, the principle of proportionality, professionalism and accountability. In addition, according to Okeiyi et al., (2015) it is because of the good recruitment of individuals who have a strong work ethic. This is mainly because good governance is a fundamental component that not only must be supported by literature and legal documents, but also, the mentality to enforce effective ethical practices must be cultivated to become city officials to ensure good governance (Muswaka, 2017). Thus, until now, officers in the ranks of the social services have never been in trouble because they have never abused their authority for personal or group gain even though there is little room for that. In fact, superiors never act arbitrarily to subordinates. However, in other circumstances, there are no employees who work in other agencies without permission or recommendation from their superiors. This can result in high ethical standards requiring a combination of patience and persistence from leaders who understand the importance of ethics and are dedicated to pursuing the right change (Glor & Greene, 2003). In addition, changes in society also have an influence on the ethical building of local government (Erakovich & Wyman, 2010).

In the case of corrupt behavior, civil servants or assistants have never owned, sold, rented or lent state assets for personal gain and for groups that harm the state. This was confirmed by the results of interviews which stated that officers never gave anything to other people or groups for personal or group interests. Even the officers have never received anything related to their position. In order to minimize and comply with the government's code of ethics, officials never provide support to candidate pairs in the political arena. This situation cannot be separated from the integrity policy stemming from the indirect leadership effect that remains focused on structural responses as the main source of ethical reasoning rather than normative control. Clarity of decisions, consistency in decision-making processes, and support for anti-corruption efforts can be improved with a balanced approach to controlling corruption (Erakovich & Kolthoff, 2016)

The inability and reluctance of political elites to address the socio-political causes of corruption and, more importantly, to bring irresponsible bureaucracies under political control helped corruption take root. Experience shows that even popularly elected representatives are unwilling or unable to take effective measures to limit corrupt practices and thereby increase the level of ethics and morality in the public service (Khan et al., 1995). This can be done through: First, integrity policies stem from indirect leadership effects that remain focused on structural responses as the main source of ethical reasoning. Second, employees and public managers make judgments about integrity in their day-to-day decisions and base actions on the norms and expectations of correct behavior found in an ethical climate. Corruption control focuses on consequences and enforces laws or regulations and does not support anti-corruption efforts (Erakovich & Kolthoff, 2016).

The moral behavior of government officials who are in the ranks of the Pengandaran Regency Social Service cannot be separated from the ethical values that are developed, namely the values of performance, namely politeness, integrity and professionalism which are carried out with full responsibility. This, according to Menzell, can show a strong relationship between the emphasis placed on organizational values that will lead to excellence and teamwork (Menzel, 1993). Because interactions are incompatible with certain personal and situational situations and always affect others, ethics in government or in other workplaces must be the responsibility of individuals and organizations (Brumback, 1991). Brumback again explains that workplace ethics cannot be left entirely to everyone's science for two obvious reasons. First, temptation and pressure at work can overcome conscience. Second, someone's unethical behavior? or always influence other people. Ethics, therefore, must be an organization? national and also individual responsibility.

From the side of the assistant, there are obstacles to implementing ethical values in the work, namely the deadline for collecting work assignment files which is sometimes short, while the companion needs to more thoroughly analyze the situation in the field with a lot of time. In addition, HR PKH recipients are sometimes difficult to find. According to Carson (2003), this can affect unwanted consequences in the growth of an ethical regulatory framework. Therefore, it is necessary to take the following steps (1) to

emphasize more on the right actions to ensure ethical government; (2) creating an ethics training program for public officials and civil servants, focusing on the common values of formal equality, social equality and integrity among civil servants and on understanding equality and individual ethical challenges faced in the office; (3) addressing ethical issues in public policy. Although individual ethics and policy ethics are not independent, the latter has been neglected; and (4) considering the ethical implications of demographic changes taking place in society and in government (Glor & Greene, 2003). These steps are taken so that ethical norms of rule, law and order in local public organizations are needed, attention and reduction of barriers to citizen involvement will strengthen social inclusion in government. Decentralized government institutions and enhanced stewardship by local governments are central to progress towards democracy (Erakovich & Wyman, 2010). The solution taken is to do every job properly, optimally and in an orderly manner, both in work in the field or providing a written accountability report. Does not involve too much pity for the assessment of the eligibility of PKH aid recipients so that PKH recipients are right on target. This is in line with Fattah's statement that a commitment to ethics that involves all government employees at all levels and incorporating ethical considerations into operational decisions is very important to reduce mistakes and protect public trust in government (Fattah, 2011) in order to develop an agenda for the relationship between governance. smart and sustainable results (Tomor et al., 2019).

#### IV. CONCLUSION

The implementation of government ethics cannot be left to individuals freely to interpret it according to their abilities and educational background. There must always be organizational intervention, in this case the local government, to determine what ethical values will be implemented as the soul of the organization. The disrespectfulness of local governments to uphold ethical values which are used as the spirit of government ethics will have an impact on the scare of government performance which is full of corruption. Even though the regulations have been drawn up as well and as in detail as possible, if there is no commitment and consistency in their implementation, it will continue to lead to violations that are committed both legally and illegally. Therefore, in improving the implementation of government ethics starting from the recruitment of employees, it is necessary to emphasize those who have a high work ethic, are honest, and uphold religious values that are manifested in faith and piety.

#### REFERENCES

1. Brumback, G. B. (1991). Institutionalizing Ethics in Government. *Public Personnel Management*, 20(3), 353-364. <https://doi.org/10.1177/009102609102000309>
2. Badan Pusat Statistik Kabupaten Ciamis. (2019). Indikator Kesejahteraan Rakyat Kabupaten Pangandaran 2019. Pangandaran: BPS Kabupaten Ciamis.
3. Badan Pusat Statistik Kabupaten Ciamis. (2019). Kabupaten Pangandaran dalam Angka 2019. Pangandaran: BPS Kabupaten Ciamis.
4. Carson, C. (2003). Scandal Proof: Do Ethics Laws Make Government Ethical? *Public Integrity*, 5(2), 173-176. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15580989.2003.11770943>
5. Chandler, R. C. (1981). A Book Review Essay on Government Ethics. *Public Personnel Management*, 10(1), 165-171. <https://doi.org/10.1177/009102608101000125>
6. Doig, A., & Skelcher, C. (2001). Ethics in Local Government: Evaluating self-regulation in England and Wales. *Local Government Studies*, 27(1), 87-108. <https://doi.org/10.1080/714004091>
7. Dunn, A. (2013). Only fools? Reconsidering the relationship between commitment to the work ethic and educational attainment. *Journal of Education and Work*, 26(1), 1-20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13639080.2011.588595>
8. Erakovich, R., & Kolthoff, E. (2016). Analysis of Ethical Leadership and Integrity Development in Local Government: The United States, The Netherlands, Montenegro, and Serbia. *International Journal of Public Administration*, 39(11), 872-882. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01900692.2015.1053612>
9. Erakovich, R., & Wyman, S. (2010). The imperative for building value reciprocity between society and city hall: Implications for local government ethics building in Serbia and Montenegro. *International Journal of Public Administration*, 33(10), 499-507. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01900692.2010.499231>
10. Fattah, M. (2011). Professional ethics and public administration in the United States. *International Journal of Public Administration*, 34(1-2), 65-72. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01900692.2010.524088>
11. Gilman, S. C. (2000). An Idea Whose Time Has Come: The International Experience of the U.S. Office of Government Ethics in Developing Anticorruption Systems. *Public Integrity*, 2(2), 135-155.

- <https://doi.org/10.1080/15580989.2000.11770828>
12. Glor, E. D., & Greene, I. (2003). The Government of Canada's Approach to Ethics: The Evolution of Ethical Government. *Public Integrity*, 5(1), 39–65. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15580989.2003.11770933>
  13. Hankivsky, O. (2006). Imagining ethical globalization: The contributions of a care ethic. *Journal of Global Ethics*, 2(1), 91–110. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17449620600677338>
  14. Khan, M. M., Rahman, M. H., & Siddiquee, N. A. (1995). Ethics and Public Service in Bangladesh. *Indian Journal of Public Administration*, 41(3), 592–608. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0019556119950338>
  15. Kleinschmit, S. W., & Edwards, V. (2017). Examining the Ethics of Government-Organized Nongovernmental Organizations (GONGOs). *Public Integrity*, 19(5), 529–546. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10999922.2017.1312213>
  16. Lawton, A., & Macaulay, M. (2004). Ethics at the crossroads? Developments in the ethical framework for local government. *Local Government Studies*, 30(4), 624–638. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0300393042000318021>
  17. McCampbell, A. S., & Rood, T. L. (1997). Ethics in government: A survey of misuse of position for personal gain and its implications for developing acquisition strategy. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 16(11), 1107–1116. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1005700812436>
  18. Menzel, D. C. (1993). Ethics Induced Stress in the Local Government Workplace. *Public Personnel Management*, 22(4), 523–536. <https://doi.org/10.1177/009102609302200402>
  19. Muswaka, P. (2017). Virtue Ethics as a Catalyst for Good Governance and Efficient Service Delivery in Zimbabwean Local Government Systems. *Journal of Social Sciences*, 53(2), 107–111. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09709274.2017.1413975>
  20. Okeiyi, S. I., Okrah, A. M., Okeiyi, E. C., Bryant, B. A., Che, E., Okeiyi, E. C., & Bryant, B. A. (2015). Operators ' Attitudes Toward Sustainable Tourism Development Concept in Ghana Operators ' Attitudes Toward Sustainable Tourism Development Concept in Ghana. 8916(October), 37–41. <https://doi.org/10.1300/J156v06n01>
  21. Rose, J., & Copus, C. (2020). Councillor ethics: a review of the Committee On Standards In Public Life's 'Local Government Ethical Standards.' *Public Money and Management*, 0(0), 1–7. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09540962.2020.1723256>
  22. Sekretaris Daerah Kabupaten Pangandaran. (2016). Peraturan Bupati Pangandaran Nomor 56 Tahun 2016 Tentang Tugas Pokok, Fungsi, Uraian Tugas dan Tata Kerja Dinas Sosial, Pemberdayaan Masyarakat dan Desa. Pangandaran: Berita Daerah Kabupaten Pangandaran
  23. Smith, R. W. (2003). Corporate ethics officers and government ethics administrators comparing apples with oranges or a lesson to be learned? *Administration and Society*, 34(6), 632–652. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0095399702239168>
  24. Smith, R. W. (2007). A conceptual model for benchmarking performance in public sector ethics programs: The missing link in government accountability? *International Journal of Public Administration*, 30(12–14), 1621–1640. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01900690701527217>
  25. Suk Kim, P., & Yun, T. (2017). Strengthening Public Service Ethics in Government: The South Korean Experience. *Public Integrity*, 19(6), 607–623. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10999922.2017.1302278>
  26. Thompson, F. (1992). Paradoxes of Government Ethics. *Public Administration Review*, 52(3), 254–259.
  27. Tomor, Z., Meijer, A., Michels, A., & Geertman, S. (2019). Smart Governance For Sustainable Cities: Findings from a Systematic Literature Review. *Journal of Urban Technology*, 26(4), 3–27. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10630732.2019.1651178>.
  28. Profil Kabupaten Pangandaran. (2020) Dapat diakses melalui <https://dev.pangandarankab.go.id/public/profile>. Diakses tanggal 14 Februari 2020
  29. Visi dan Misi Dinas Sosial Kabupaten Pangandaran. (2020). Dapat diakses melalui <https://dinsospmd.pangandarankab.go.id/public/profil/visimisi>. Diakses tanggal 14 Februari 2020
  30. Tugas dan Fungsi Dinas Sosial, Pemberdayaan Masyarakat dan Desa. (2020). Dapat diakses melalui <https://dinsospmd.pangandarankab.go.id/public/profil/tupoksi>. Diakses tanggal 14 Februari 2020