



Systematic Literature Review: Teaching Aids (TAs) in Asia's Islamic Education

Siti Fauziah Mohd Amin, Faculty of Psychology and Education, Universiti Malaysia Sabah, Malaysia, ummuadib1706@gmail.com

Sabariah Sharif, Faculty of Psychology and Education, Universiti Malaysia Sabah, Malaysia, sabariah@ums.edu.my

Mad Nor Madjapuni, Faculty of Psychology and Education, Universiti Malaysia Sabah, Malaysia, mdnoormj@ums.edu.my

Muhamad Suhaimi Taat, Faculty of Psychology and Education, Universiti Malaysia Sabah, Malaysia, suhaimi@ums.edu.my

Muralindran Mariappan, Faculty of Engineering, Universiti Malaysia Sabah, Malaysia, murali@ums.edu.my

Abstract- The employment and development of teaching aids (TAs) in the learning of Islamic Education are typical in 21st-century learning. Nevertheless, many new researchers in the domain of Islamic Education were not aware of the existence of various TAs that were developed or utilised in the learning of Islamic Education. Thus, this research concentrated on searches related to the development and use of prior Islamic Education's TAs. This study adopted the ROSES review protocol to obtain information related to the development and use of Islamic Education's TAs. Data search was done using the Scopus, Springer, ScienceDirect, JSTOR, Dimension, Google Scholar, My Cite and DOAJ databases. The conclusions of the research revealed that Islamic Education's TAs developed by previous researchers in Asia were e-Jawi, interactive Islamic Prayer (iIP), Moodle e-learning, i-Talk Pismen, Global Zakat Game, Smart Al-Fatihah, mobile learning, video, Yadun Method innovation, e-Pendidikan Islam and Jawi-AR Application. While TAs employed by preceding researchers in Asia covered the application of games, word cards, Smart Iqra', vle-frog, interactive whiteboard, video, Instructional Video Dram, ICT media, i-think mind map, digital Quran, map mind, interactive multimedia applications, innovation, internet, PowerPoint, flash, digital hadith, ebook, comics, exercise books, notebooks, audio media, visual media, Iqra and mobile learning. This research could be employed as a guide to search for Islamic Education TAs or develop new TAs materials for Islamic Education subjects.

Keywords: Teaching aids; Learning aids; Learning tools; Islamic Education

I. INTRODUCTION

Nowadays, Islamic Education learning is conducted employing diverse forms of teaching aids (TAs). The use of TAs using appropriate learning approaches and methods can save time (Khasim et al., 2017), facilitate the implementation of learning (Higgins et al., 2016; Noh, et al., 2016), attract interest and increase students' level of understanding (Farsi & Munro, 2016; Ilias et al., 2016). It is following the use of TAs in the Islamic perspective, which was practised since the time of Rasulullah PBUH. Rasulullah PBUH used authentic materials and artificial materials available at that time when he taught about the implementation of worship to the companions (Ilias et al., 2017). The use of these materials made it easier for Rasulullah PBUH to explain about worship more efficiently and effectively (Ilias et al., 2017; Harun et al., 2015).

21st-century learning, which is practised in the field of education today, shows that there are various Islamic Education TAs developed and used by past researchers covering the *tilawah*, *hadith*, *ibadah*, *aqidah*, *sirah* and manners (Abdullah & Zhaffar, 2018). These preliminary studies are advantageous as a guide for the selection and development of effective TAs. It is to be used in the learning of Islamic Education. The selection and development of this TAs should be relevant to the infrastructure facilities available at the school, location and level of students (Jasmi & Tamuri, 2013). Hence, this research concentrated on the use and development of Islamic Education TAs conducted by previous researchers. These past studies could be used as a reference for the selection of appropriate TAs and as a guide for future researchers who focus on research in the field of research and development of new TAs in Islamic Education.

Research questions:

This study focused on two main questions:

1. What were the teaching aids developed by previous researchers in the study of Islamic Education in Asia?
2. What were the teaching aids used by previous researchers in the study of Islamic Education in Asia?

II. METHODOLOGY

The discussion of the systematic study methodology of this literature review was divided into discussions related to ROSES, the process of formulation of research questions, systematic search strategies, quality assessment and data analysis strategies.

ROSES

This study employed a guide from the ROSES (Reporting Standards for Systematic Evidence Syntheses) literature protocol as a guide to finding past studies related to the development and use of teaching aids (TAs) of Islamic Education. Based on this protocol, the researcher reported that the main methods and steps in the prescribed review process aimed at improving the quality and planning more systematically (Haddaway et al., 2017).

Research Question Formation Process

The questions of this study were developed using PICO. PICO is one of the tools to develop research questions that help researchers develop research questions based on three main concepts, namely population or problem, importance and context (Shaffril, et al., 2020). The application of this concept is shown in Table 1.

Table 1: The use of PICO in the formation of research questions

Population	Importance	Context
Past researchers	Teaching Aids for Islamic Education	Asia

Based on these three concepts, the researcher formed the main research question, which was, what were the teaching aids (TAs) Islamic Education developed and used in Asia? These research questions were then detailed into two main questions as contained in the research sub-questions. The details of these two research questions were intended to discuss the findings of the study in a more systematic and directed manner.

Systematic searching strategies

Discussions related to this strategy included the identification phase, screening phase, eligibility phase, quality appraisal and data analysis strategies.

Identification

The process of determining the main keywords was done based on the research questions, namely "teaching aids" and "Islamic Education". Other keywords were formed through the search for synonyms and variations of the main keywords using dictionaries, thesaurus and keywords used by past researchers. After that, the search string formation was done in search of articles using the database Scopus, Springer, ScienceDirect, JSTOR, Dimension, Google Scholar, My Cite and DOAJ. The keywords used in this phase are shown in Table 2.

Table 2: Keywords used in the study.

Database	Keywords
Scopus	TITLE-ABS-KEY(("learn* tool*" OR "learn* aid*" OR "learn* device*" OR "learn* gadget*" OR "learn* engine*" OR "learn* weapon*" OR "teach* tool*" OR "teach* aid*" OR "teach* device*" OR "teach* gadget*" OR "teach* engine*" OR "teach* weapon*" OR "bahan bantu mengajar" OR "bahan bantu belajar" OR "alat bantu mengajar" OR "media pembelajaran") AND ("islam* edu*" OR "islam* stud*" OR "pendidikanislam" OR "pengajianislam" OR "wisdom" OR "faith" OR "islam*"

	history" OR "ethic" OR "tilawah" OR "hadis" OR "ibadah" OR "akidah" OR "sirah" OR "akhlak"))
Springer	"teaching aid" OR "learning tool" OR "bahan bantu mengajar" AND "Islamic education" OR "Islamic studies" or "pendidikanislam"
ScienceDirect	("learning tool" OR "teaching aid" OR "bahan bantu mengajar" OR "bahan bantu belajar") AND ("islamic education" OR "islamic studies" OR "pendidikanislam" OR "pengajianislam")
JSTOR	((("teaching aid*") OR ("learning tool*")) AND ("islamicedu*")) OR ("islamic studies"))
Dimension.ai	"bahan bantu mengajar" OR "bahan bantu belajar" OR "alat bantu mengajar" OR "alat bantu belajar" OR "learning tool" OR "learning aid" OR "teaching tool" OR "teaching aid" AND "pendidikanislam"
Google Scholar	("bahan bantu mengajar" OR "bahan bantu belajar" OR "alat bantu mengajar" OR "alat bantu belajar" OR "learning tool" OR "learning aid" OR "teaching tool" OR "teaching aid") AND ("pendidikanislam" OR "islamic education" OR "islamic studies")
MyCite	bahan bantu belajar OR bahan bantu mengajar OR learning tool OR teaching aid AND pendidikan Islam OR Islamic education
DOAJ	media pembelajaran pendidikan islam

A search based on the keywords displayed in Table 3 on 11 July 2020 in the identification phase successfully attained 16 520 materials correlated to the development and use of Islamic Education learning aids.

Screening

The screening phase was done by setting the criteria, as shown in Table 3.

Table 3: Literature of material selection criteria.

Criteria	Eligibility	Exclusion
Literature Type	Literature Type	Literature review articles, chapters in books, conference papers.
Language	English, Malay and Indonesian	Non-English (Except Bahasa Malaysia and Indonesian)
Time	Between 2016- 11 July 2020	<2016 > 11 July 2020

Based on table 2, the criteria set included the literature type, language and time. A total of 13 129 articles were excluded because they did not satisfy the selection criteria set. The result of this screening process was only 3 390 articles left to undergo the next phase, which was the eligibility phase.

Eligibility

Selected articles were reviewed manually through the title, abstract and content of the article. This phase intended to identify articles that were genuinely relevant to the objectives of the study. A sum of 40 articles out of 339 articles were retained after the eligibility process was performed.

Quality appraisal

Data obtained from the systematic process of the literature review were analysed using qualitative methods. Two evaluators were appointed to evaluate the articles obtained. The evaluation process was done based on the recommendations of Petticrew & Roberts (2006) by evaluating the methodology of selected articles into three high, moderate and low levels. Only articles that reached high and medium levels in the methodology section were evaluated as quality articles. At the same time, articles categorised

as having a low methodology will be removed. A total of 40 articles were evaluated to obtain quality articles. As a result, 19 articles were rated as high, while 16 articles were categorised as moderate, and seven articles were removed because the quality of the methodology was at a low level.

Data Analysis Strategies

Analysis of data obtained from articles that were evaluated for quality will be included in Table 4: Development of Islamic Education TAs in Malaysia (2016-11 July 2020) and Table 5: Use of Islamic Education TAs in Malaysia (2016-11 July 2020) containing the name of the researcher, year, country, institution, teaching aids and field of Islamic Education.

III. RESULT

Findings related to the development of Islamic Education TAS in Asia around 2016 to July 2020 are shown in Table 4.

Table 4: Development of Islamic Education TAs in Malaysia (2016- 11 July 2020)

Author	Year	Country	Institutions	TAs	Field
Rahim & Hamzah	2016	Malaysia	Preschool	e-Jawi	Jawi
Farsi & Munro	2016	Saudi Arabia	Primary School	interactive Islamic Prayer (iIP)	Salah <i>Fiqh</i>
Daulay, Firmansyah & Zakaria	2017	Indonesia	University	e-Learning Media Based Moodle	General
Rahman, Ibrahim, Abidin & Fauzi	2017	Malaysia	General	Global Zakat Game Product	Zakat
Nabil, Jaafar, Raus & Masro	2018	Malaysia	General	i-Talk Pismen	General
Khalidi, Hamid, Khalid, Hassan & Daoh	2018	Malaysia	Primary School	Smart Al- Fatihah Game	Tilawah
Hamisan, Yama, Masrop, Nasir, Awang & Kechik	2019	Malaysia	College	Mobile learning	Hadith
Fahyuni & Aini	2019	Indonesia	Secondary School	Learning video	Salah <i>Fiqh</i>
Hamzah & Said	2019	Malaysia	School	Innovation of <i>Yadun</i> Method	<i>Tajweed</i>
Mahzan & Othman	2019	Malaysia	<i>Pondok</i> Institutions	e-Islamic Education Prototype	Salah <i>Fiqh</i>
Suhaimi, Yatim, Wahab & Idrus	2020	Malaysia	Primary School	Jawi-AR Application	Jawi
Yahaya & Zaini	2020	Malaysia	Secondary School	Mobile Apps	General

Meanwhile, the findings of the study related to the use of Islamic Education TAS in Malaysia around the year 2016- 11 July 2020 are shown in Table 5.

Table 5: TAs used for Islamic Education in Asia around 2016 to 11 July 2020.

Author	Year	Country	Institution	TAs	Field
Nurdin	2016	Indonesia	General	Innovation, internet, PowerPoint, flash, digital al-Qur'an, digital Hadiths, ebook, games	General
Harun et al.	2016	Malaysia	Primary and Secondary School	Vle Frog	General
Anas, Ghazali, Ramlan & Hanafi	2017	Malaysia	University	digital Quran Application	Tilawah
Ibrahim	2017	Nigeria	Secondary School	Instructional Video Dram	General

Khasim, Zain&Hamzah	2017	Malaysia	General	Comics, exercise books, notebooks, Iqra	General
Wahab, Lubis, Mustapha, Sjahrony& Febria	2017	Malaysia	Primary School	Multimedia Language Games	Al-Quran & Jawi
Zulfa	2018	Indonesia	Secondary School	Video blogging (VLOG)	Halal & haram food
Irfan et al.	2018	Indonesia	Primary School	Word card	General
Aziz &Jaafar	2018	Malaysia	Primary School	Smart Iqra', interactive multimedia application	Tilawah
Suhardi	2018	Indonesia	Institute of higher education	Mind map	General
Fauzi&Khairuldin	2018	Malaysia	University	Mobile learning	Tilawah
Rashid, Salleh& Noor	2018	Malaysia	Primary School	'G-Jawi' Mobile Game	Jawi
Miasan&Kasim	2018	Malaysia	General	Mobile learning	General
Shafie	2018	Malaysia	Polytechnic	Interactive multimedia application	Salah Fiqh
Lengono	2019	Indonesia	Secondary School	Media ICT	General
Ernanida&Yusra	2019	Indonesia	General	Audio & visual media	General
Abdullah & Idris	2019	Malaysia	Secondary School	Material	General
Al-Salkhi	2019	Jordan	Primary School	Interactive Whiteboard	General
Datau&Arif	2019	Indonesia	Primary School	Video	Salah Fiqh
Manshur&Ramdiani	2019	Indonesia	General	audio & visual Media	General
Daud&Rahman	2020	Malaysia	Secondary School	I-Think Mind Map	General

IV. DISCUSSION

TAS in Islamic Education subjects incorporated the development and use of TAS from preschool to tertiary level education. Multiple development and use of Islamic Education TAS was done in previous studies concerning the development and use of TAS which was explicitly done for the parts of Islamic Education, namely *tilawah*, hadith, *aqidah*, *ibadah*, *sirah*, manner, *jawi* and *tajweed*. Besides, there was also the development and use of Islamic Education TAS, which was performed in general for Islamic Education without specialising in certain parts. The development and use of Islamic Education TAS in these previous studies were done in various countries in Asia, including Malaysia, Indonesia, Saudi Arabia, Nigeria and Jordan.

For example, the development of e-Jawi was done by Rahim and Hamzah (2016), specifically for the *Jawi* division for preschool. While for primary schools the development of Interactive Islamic Prayer (iIP) for prayer was done by Farsi and Munro, the development of Smart Al-Fatihah game was done by Khalid et al., (2018) and the Jawi-AR application developed by Suhaimi et al., (2020). Development for secondary schools was done by Nabil et al., (2018), Fahyuni and Aini (2019), Hamzah and Said (2019) as well as Yahaya and Zaini (2020) by developing i-Talk Pismen (audio interactive software of Islamic Education book), learning videos for prayer, *yadun* method innovation for *tajweed* and Mobile Apps for Islamic Education. While the development of Islamic Education TAS for use at the tertiary level produces mobile learning, as well as e-learning based on Moodle, was developed by Daulay et al., (2017). The development of TAS for *Pondok* institutions was done by Mahzan and Othman (2019) by producing a prototype e Islamic Education.

In addition to the developments made specifically for students in individual educational institutions, there was also the advancement of TAs Islamic Education successfully producing Global Zakat Game products done by Rahman et al., (2017) without specialising in certain educational institutions. The development of TAS Islamic Education conducted by previous researchers was done based on the needs analysis and appropriate development model to produce innovations, games, prototypes, internet applications, mobile applications, interactive systems and video learning. In general, these developments had succeeded in producing compelling TAS to increase information, knowledge, achievement, interest, motivation, positive attitude, cooperation and healthy competition among students. These developed TAs also had a high level of reliability and relevance practised in 21st Century education today.

Previous studies related to the use of Islamic Education TAS administered by many past researchers included the use of multimedia language games (Wahab et al., 2017), word cards (Irfan et al., 2018) Smart Iqra'interactive media application (Aziz & Jafar, 2018), vle-frog (Harun et al., 2016), 'G-Jawi' Mobile Game (Rashid et al., 2018), interactive whiteboard (Salkhi, 2019) and video (Datau & Arif, 2019) for primary schools. As for secondary school, the use of Instructional Video Dram (Ibrahim, 2017), video blogging (Zulfa, 2018), ICT media (Lenggono, 2019) and i-think mind map (Daud & Rahman, 2020) was done by previous researchers. Studies involving the use of TAs at the tertiary level involved the use of digital al-Quran applications (Anas et al., 2017), mind maps (Suhardi, 2018), mobile learning (Fauzi & Khairuldin, 2018) and interactive multimedia applications (Shafie, 2018). While studies conducted in general without specifying specific educational institutions concerned the use of innovation, internet, PowerPoint, flash, digital Quran, digital hadith, ebook, games (Nurdin, 2016) comics, exercise books, notebooks, Iqra (Khasim et al., 2017), audio media, visual media (Ernanida & Yusra, 2019; Manshur & Ramdlani, 2019) and mobile learning (Miasan & Kasim, 2018).

The results of this research related to the use of TAs designed more valuable, engaging, active learning and provided a positive impression in improving students' understanding, achievement, interest and motivation. Also, some studies revealed that the perception and willingness of teachers to use TAS is at a high level. Meanwhile, studies using experimental methods reported that treatment groups that use specific TAs in Islamic Education learning showed higher achievement and motivation than control groups that use traditional learning. Generally, studies involving the use of specific TAs in Islamic Education learning had succeeded in making learning more effective and efficient.

V. LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The search for past studies related to aids (TAS) teaching Islamic Education in this study was limited to the use of systematic review method. The study focused on the search for journal articles using the medium of English, Malay and Indonesian through the database Scopus, Springer, ScienceDirect, JSTOR, Dimension, Google Scholar, My Cite and DOAJ published in the period 2016 until 11 July 2020. However, there was one article that was not available even though the researcher had tried to use another database and contacted the main author via email.

VI. STUDY RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the limitations of the above study, other researchers who intend to focus on reviews related to Islamic Education teaching aids are proposed to use methods other than systematic review methods such as rapid evidence assessment scoping review integrative review, realist review narrative review and review of review (umbrella review) (Noble & Smith, 2018). Furthermore, future studies are suggested to use various sources other than journal articles by increasing the use of databases other than Scopus, Springer, ScienceDirect, JSTOR, Dimension, Google Scholar, Mycite and DOAJ using various languages and extending the study period after July 2020 and before 2016.

VII. CONCLUSION

Ergo, it is conspicuous that TAS for Islamic Education in Asia covers the development and employment of innovations, games, prototypes, internet applications, mobile applications, interactive systems, audio media, visual media, ICT media and video learning. These TAs successfully intensifies students'

understanding, knowledge, achievement, motivation and interest. Moreover, the development and use of this TAs propitiously create more productive, exciting and practical learning. These earlier studies can be adopted as a reference by Islamic Education Teachers to select the relevant TAs as well as a guide for future researchers who aim to conduct a study related to the development of new Islamic Education TAs.

REFERENCES

1. Abdullah, W.A.A.W., & Zhaffar, N.M. (2018). *Inovasi Pendidikan Islam inspirasi dan transformasi*. ITBM.
2. Abdullah, MA, & Idris, M.R. (2019). Practice of use of materials to teach Islamic education teachers of religious high school. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 8(4), 1088–1093.
3. Anas, N., Ghazali, Z.M., Ramlan, A.N.M., & Hanafi, MR (2017). The use of Digital Quran application among diploma Students of UiTM Perak branch, Tapah Campus. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 7(2), 561-569.
4. Al-Salkhi, M.J. (2019). Using interactive whiteboard in teaching Islamic education and its effect on some variables. *American Journal of Educational Research*, 7(3), 249-257. <https://doi.org/10.12691/education-7-3-10>.
5. Aziz, N.A.A., & Jaafar, N. (2018). Penguasaan pembelajaran al-Qur'an berbantuan Aplikasi Multimedia Interaktif Smart Iqra': kajian di Sekolah Kebangsaan Pendidikan Khas Alma, Pulau Pinang. *JQSS: Journal of Quran Sunnah Education and Special Needs*, 2(2), 24-36.
6. Datau, D.A.H., & Arif, M. (2019). Efektivitas penggunaan video pembelajaran dalam meningkatkan kemampuan mempraktikkan shalat bagi peserta didik MI Al-Wathaniyah Kota Gorontalo. *Irfani*, 14(2), 1-11. <http://journal.iaingorontalo.ac.id/index.php/ir>.
7. Daud, R., & Rahman, R.A. (2020). Persepsi guru terhadap penggunaan peta pemikiran i-think dalam pengajaran Pendidikan Islam. *BITARA International Journal of Civilizational Studies and Human Sciences*, 3(2), 124-140.
8. Daulay, L.A., Firmansyah & Zakaria, R. (2017). The development of e-Learning Media Based Moodle to increase science development and Islamic studies in STAIN Gajah Putih. *Al-Ta'lim Journal*, 24(2), 103-109. <http://dx.doi.org/10.15548/jt.v24i2.275>.
9. Ernanda, E. & Yusra, R. A. (2019). Media audio visual dalam pembelajaran PAI. *Murabby: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 2(1), 101-112.
10. Fahyuni, E.F., & Aini, W. (2019). Pengembangan video pembelajaran tutorial sujud pada mata pelajaran pendidikan agama Islam pada sekolah menengah pertama. *HALAQAH: Islamic Education Journal*, 3(1), 43-52. <https://doi.org/10.21070/halaqa.v3i1.1780>.
11. Farsi, M., & Munro, M. (2016). Design and implementation of an interactive system for teaching the Islamic prayer. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 4(5), 139–148. <https://doi.org/10.11114/jets.v4i5.1481>.
12. Fauzi, N., & Khairuldin. WKFW (2017). The readiness of usage mobile learning (m-learning) towards the Qur'an learning in Islamic Studies course among the students in Unisza, Terengganu. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 7(4), 32-42.
13. Haddaway N.R., Macura B., Whaley P., & Pullin A.S. (2017). *ROSES for Systematic Review Protocols*. Version 1.0. <https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.5897269.v4>.
14. Hamisan@Khair, N. S., Yama, P., Masrop, N. A. M., Nasir, M. N., Awang, A. H., & Kechik, A. A. A. (2019). Mobile learning in the study of hadith: a study on students' understanding on the arrangement of sanad with specific symbol. *International Journal of Modern Trends in Social Sciences*, 2(6), 100-114.
15. Jaafar, H.H., & Said, M.H.M. (2019). Inovasi pengajaran untuk menarik minat pelajar menguasai ilmu tajwid. *International Journal of Humanities Technology and Civilization (IJHTC)*, 1(6), 8-17. <http://journal.ump.edu.my/ijhtc>.

16. Harun, M.A.W., Ruskam, A., Baharuddin, A.S., Othman, R., & Sarip, M.A.A. (2015). Epistemologi praktik bahan bantu mengajar nabawi dalam pengajaran dan pembelajaran. *International Journal of Islamic and Civilizational Studies*, 2, 45–55.
17. Harun, H., Esa, A., Amiruddin, M.H., Masek, A., Samad, N. A., Noor, SNFM, & Kamarudin, M.H. (2016). Utilisation of Frog Vle as teaching tools: readiness of Islamic education teachers in Muar district schools. *American Scientific Publishers*, 1-5.
18. Higgins, S., Katsipataki, M., Villanueva-Aguilera, A.B., Coleman, R., Henderson, P., Major, L.E., Coe, R., & Mason, D. (2016). *The sutton trust-education endowment foundation teaching and learning toolkit. Manual*. Education Endowment Foundation.
19. Hole, Y., & Snehal, P. & Bhaskar, M. (2018). Service marketing and quality strategies. *Periodicals of engineering and natural sciences*, 6 (1), 182-196.
20. Hole, Y., & Snehal, P. & Bhaskar, M. (2019). Porter's five forces model: gives you a competitive advantage. *Journal of Advanced Research in Dynamical and Control System*, 11 (4), 1436-1448.
21. Ibrahim, A. A. (2017). Integrating instructional video drama to enhance Islamic studies students' intrinsic motivation: an experimental research. *Asian Research Journal of Arts & Social Sciences* 2(3): 1-8.
22. Ilias, M.F., Hassan, W.E.W, Jasmi, K.A. (2017). Aplikasi bahan bantu mengajar Rasulullah dari perspektif Muhammad Fuad Abd al-Baqi dalam *Pemikiran Pendidikan Islam dalam Kalangan Tokoh Dunia Islam*. Penerbit UTM Press, 19-38.
23. Ilias, M.F., Husain, K., Noh, M. A. M., Rashed, Z.N., & Abdullah, M. (2016). Sumber bahan bantu mengajar dalam kalangan Guru Pendidikan Islam Sekolah Bestari. *E-Academia Journal UiTMT*, 5(2), 106–114.
24. Irfan, M., Ikhwana, I., Rismawati, R., Hamsidar, H., Rahmah, K., Suhardin, S., Afifah, R.N., & Syah, A. (2018). Penerapan media visual text card materi sifat mustahil Allah pada mata pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) di Kelas Iii SDIT Al-Mawaddah Warrahmah Kolaka M. *Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan Madrasah*, 1(2), 123-150.
25. Jasmi, K.A., & Tamuri, A.H. (2013). *Pendidikan Islam kaedah pengajaran dan pembelajaran* (6th ed). Penerbit UTM Press.
26. Khalid, M.N.M., Hamid, H.A., Khalid, M.F., Hassan, M.A.A., Daoh, M. (2018). Pembangunan perisian multimedia permainan Smart Al-Fatihah. *Journal of Fatwa Management and Research (Jfatwa), SeFPiA 2018*, Edisi Khas, 564-579.
27. Khasim, N., Zain, A.M., & Hamzah, M. H. (2017). Amalan penggunaan bahan bantu mengajar guru cemerlang Pendidikan Islam. *Journal of Islamic, Social, Economics and Development (JISED)*, 2(6), 56-69.
28. Lenggono, W. (2019). Peran media ict pada pembelajaran al Islam dan kemuhammadiyah dan penggunaannya di SMP Muhammadiyah 1 Purwokerto. *At-Ta'lim: Media Informasi Pendidikan Islam*, 18(1), 157-178.
29. Mahzan, S. K., & Othman M. K. (2019). Pembangunan Sistem Prototaip e-Pendidikan Islam berasaskan teknologi web di institusi pondok di Kedah. *International Journal of Education, Psychology and Counseling*, 4(26), 01-26.
30. Manshur, U., & Ramdlani, M. (2019). Media audio visual dalam pembelajaran PAI. *AL MURABBI: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 5(1), 1-8.
31. Miasan, N.A., & Kasim, T.S.A.T. (2018). Pengamalan m-pembelajaran dalam kalangan guru novis Pendidikan Islam di Sabah. *Journal of Islamic Educational Research (JIER)*, 3(1), 11-20.
32. Nabil, N.M., Jaafar, N., Raus, N.M., & Masrom, N.W. (2018). Pembangunan perisian interaktif audio buku pendidikan islam sekolah menengah kebangsaan (i-TALK PISMEN): satu kajian keperluan bagi murid berkeperluan khas masalah penglihatan. *International Journal for Studies on Children, Women, Elderly And Disabled*, 6, 81-88.
33. Noh, M.A.M, Ilias, M.F., Husain, K., Sulaiman, M. S., & Abdullah, M. (2016). Inisiatif dan usaha guru dalam meningkatkan pengetahuan semasa penggunaan bahan bantu mengajar. *Journal of Social Science and Humanities (e-Bangi). Special Issue 3*, 133-144.

34. Nurdin, A. (2016). Inovasi pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam di era information and communication technology. *Tadrîs*, 11(1), 49-64.
35. Petticrew, M. & Roberts, H. (2006). *Systematic reviews in the social sciences a practical guide*. Blackwell Publishing.
36. Rahim, S.N.A., & Hamzah, R. (2016).E-Jawi: digital learning tool for jawi character recognition.*Journal of Computing Technologies and Creative Content*, 1(1), 55-58.
37. Rahman, A.A., Ibrahim, I.H., Abidin, TMTZ, & Fauzi, AAM (2017). Gamification in Islamic education based on Global Zakat Game: Bijak Zakat version 1.0 (GZG).*Al-Qanatir: International of Islamic Studies*,6(1), 1-9.
38. Rashid, N.A.M., Salleh, SM, & Noor. NM (2018). The role of game elements in improving jawi skills through a Mobile Game 'G-Jawi'. *ijim*, 12(7), 20-30. <https://doi.org/10.3991/ijim.v12i7.9636>.
39. Shafie, M.K. (2018). Keberkesanan aplikasi multimedia dalam pengajaran dan pembelajaran ibadah solat .*International Journal of Civilizational Studies and Human Sciences*, 1(4), 50-60.
40. Shaffril, H.A.M., Ahmad, N., Samsuddin, S.F., Samah, AA, & Hamdan, M.E. (2020). Systematic literature review on adaptation towards climate change impacts among indigenous people in the Asia Pacific regions. *Journal of Cleaner Production* 258(2020), 1-14.
41. Suhaimi, S., Yatim, N.A.M., Wahab, M.H.A, Idrus, S.Z.S. (2020). Jawi-AR Apps: Single Jawi character connecting method to single words using AR Technology. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* 1529 (2020), 1-5. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1529/3/032001>.
42. Suhardi, A. (2018). Pengaruh penggunaan mind map terhadap pemahaman Konsep Pendidikan Agama Islam bagi mahasiswa Iain Jember.*IJIT: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Teaching*, 1(1), 29-49.
43. Wahab, N.S.A., Lubis, M.A., Mustapha, R., Sjahrony, A., & Febria, D. (2017).Kefahaman al-Quran dan jawi melalui permainan bahasa bermultimedia. *ASEAN Comparative Education Research Journal on Islam and Civilization (ACER-J)*, 1(1), 41-53.
44. Yahaya. WAJW, & Zaini, KM (2020). The effects of a mobile app with tutorial learning strategy on anxiety level of secondary students. *AECT: Association for Educational Communications Technology*, 525-532.<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11528-020-00505-4>.
45. Yogesh Hole et al 2019 J. Phys.: Conf. Ser. 1362 012121
46. Zulfa, Z.Y. (2018). Peningkatan hasil belajar materi Pendidikan Agama Islam dengan media pembelajaran berbasis video blogging (vlog) (studi materi makanan halal dan haram Kelas 8 SMP Negeri 4 Lamongan). *EDU-RELIGIA: Jurnal Keagamaan dan Pembelajarannya*,1(2), 16-29.