



Elementary Educational Reforms in Pakistan: An Analysis of Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

Dr. Muhammad Idrees, Assistant Professor of Education, Abdul Wali Khan University, Mardan, Pakistan, midrees@awkum.edu.pk

Dr. Said Saeed, Senior Subject Specialist, Government Higher Secondary School, Bughdada, Mardan, Pakistan, syedsaeed54@gmail.com

Dr. Khalid Iqbal, Principal, Government Higher Secondary School, Jamal Ghari, Mardan, Pakistan, drabuhanifa.edu@gmail.com

Abstract- Education is the backbone of civilization, the most dominant tool of behavioral change and fulfills the needs of the society in accord with social, economic, ideological and cultural context. The aim of the study was to investigate elementary educational reforms in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, to make aware the educators about the reforms at elementary level; assess the worth of the reforms; know about the various areas of the reforms; and examine the implementation of reforms. All the government elementary (primary and middle) schools' heads and teachers (N=76476) of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa constituted population of the study. Multistage stage random sampling procedure was used to select a sample of 500 respondents. Data was collected through self-made questionnaire and analyzed through percentage, inferential statistics, and chi-square through SPSS version 26. The study revealed management weaknesses, data information system flaw; teachers' non-punctuality, students' less attendance and enrollment, non-existence of Online management system, ineffective utilization of resources, non-functional schools, and non-accountability system, no SLOs based assessment practice at elementary level, school based appointment policy through NTS, and non-provision of Lab and Library facilities. It was also found out that the change in the professional qualification would not strengthen the teacher performance. It was suggested that an accountability cell may be established to keep check on the whole proceedings, all the reforms should be done in the light of indigenous research and launched after pilot testing, workshops may be arranged for professional development of teachers and libraries, laboratories facilities, playground and ICT may be provided to the elementary schools.

Keywords: Education, Reforms, Elementary Level, Management, Curriculum

I. INTRODUCTION

Education system of a country has to play an imperative role in shaping the future of the society. It is related to those multifarious activities, approaches and modes of thoughts and conducts that produce 'educated citizen' as its task bring positive and constructive changes and achievements (Zembylas, & Papanastasiou, 2015). According to Cerghit (2008) Education can be best understood from three prospective i.e. education as process, education as an action and education as social activity. Technological revolution changed the world around and these changes should be fully utilized for the benefit of learning in education. Therefore, changes and reforms should be brought in the field of education. It is clear that schools' reforms and improvements needed to be ensured that the people, who employ, manage and carry out the basic mechanism should have proper training, support, resources and proper timing. In addition, proper incentives and guarantees for individual when they become involved in complexities of organized changes (Adelman & Taylor, 2007).

The notion of reform and education has proper application and will be beneficial if these processes satisfy certain criteria and guaranteed the required needs. It might be said that the aim of reform is to bring such changes that fulfill the demand of the day to make the individual fitted for individual and social life as well. The responsibility of the execution and realization of national educational policy is the premises of provincial departments. Management of the different types of educational institutions i.e. elementary, secondary, higher schools and even technical education rest in the hand of the provincial government (Ministry of Education, 2008). The improvement of schools is clearly needed to start with lucid framework and plans for the changes which have been mapped. It is also clear that there should be an apparent and clear framework and strategies to get from every possible corner, especially when these improvements need major systematic changes (Adelman and Taylor, 2007). The framework of the educational reforms efforts in the province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa have been planned and designed by keeping in view the goals EFA and MDGs, Poverty Reduction Strategy and the Provincial Reforms

Program of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government. Since 2009 Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has received financial aid and grants from the DFID (Department for International Development) for educational reform. The aim of this assistance is to provide free textbooks to all students from grades 1 to 12, school construction, to provide technical assistance, to bestow stipends to female students from grades 6 to 10. It was stressed that access of school age children especially girls and children will be assured by 2015 to provide an absolute, inclusive, free and compulsory primary education of a high quality.

Objectives of the study

The objectives of the study were to;

1. make aware the educators about the reforms at elementary level
2. assess the worth of the reforms
3. know about the various areas about the reforms
4. examine the implementation of reforms and
5. Determine the impacts of the reforms.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

Education is the backbone of civilization. It always plays a pivotal role in the development of nations around the world. Yara and Otieno (2012) considered that it is the fundamental human right. Education is essential and the chief instrument in the development of cultural, economic, scientific and other social areas. Education is the key to providing equal opportunities for every child in life (DoES, 2017). Education is the center of ideological growth and social construction and it strengthens the nation states (Saigol, 2002). According to Amin et al., (2013) "education is the basis of success and teachers are the key figures in the process of education. It is pivotal to maintain the economic growth and transforming the growing economy into strong community building (DoES, 2017). According to Winkler (2005), the quality of education can only be getting better if process, practice and behavior change within the learning academies itself. Provincial departments of education are accountable for the execution of education policies and the management and supervision of all the schools that is primary, secondary, higher and technical education in the provinces (MoE, 2008). According to Said (2007), the district education department is headed by the EDO and it is the responsibility of the district government for overseeing and managing school and education process.

Educational Reforms

The aim of the educational reform is to meet and comply with universal obligations on education. Referring to reforms in education sectors, it is often referred to changes, modification and transformation in the school system in terms of factors such as "educational philosophy, policy for learners, curriculum, pedagogy, regulation, organizational setup, administration, financing, and relations to national development, the chief aim of education is to promote and enhance holistic education, especially for the most susceptible and disadvantaged children, and to ensure free, compulsory and education" (Adejumobi, &ojikutu, 2013). According to Popkewitz (2002), "educational reforms include questions about social construction, production and state directive and rules, which in turn construct them. Reforms depend on a discussion that often stayed concealed and that ascertain our way of looking at the school environment; perceptions that create social values and power relations that are not neutral". Educational reforms are definitely one of the most intricate, multifaceted and controversial issues because of their impact in the societies in which they take place. However, this situation allows us to examine the causes why reforms lead to considerable modification in the school systems in which they are working. Adelman and Taylor (2007) said that even though many of the issues about systematic change are obvious, their fundamental impact on school improvement is largely ignored. Therefore, it is not astonishing that numerous efforts fail to improve the learning institutions (Aziz, et.al 2014).

Quality education, teacher competence, teachers' performance, professional growth of teachers is straight way related to the growth and development and growth of the other staff member of the school (Daria Tot, 2014). Teachers Training and Performance re correlated (Erdem et al., 2014). Classroom learning environment has a significant relationship with high performance (Rosen, 2012). Monitoring has improved schools' standards (Khan et al., 2017).

III. METHODOLOGY

This study was descriptive in nature and Kothari (2003), is of the opinion that major purpose of the descriptive is to ascertain the current state of affairs. This chapter described the constitution of

population, sampling technique, data collection instrument and its construction, pilot study, refinement, data analysis instruments

Population

All the government elementary (primary and middle schools) schools' heads and working teachers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa constituted population for the study.

Table 1 shows the population for the study

Table: 1 S.No	Schools	Boys	Girls	Total	Teachers
1	Primary Schools	12543	8415	20958	76476
2	Middle Schools	1466	1164	2630	15666
3	Total	14009	9579	23588	92142

Sample

Total 500 sample was taken from the target population, using simple and stratified sampling procedure

Table 2 shows the distribution of the sample district wise.

Table: 2 Districts	Schools	Category		Heads +Teachers	Respondents	
Boys	Girls	Primary	Middle	Boys	Girls	
Mardan	10	10	10	10+40 =50	10+40 = 50	100
20		20		100		
Peshawar	10	10	10	10+40 =50	10+40 = 50	100
20		20		100		
Charsada	10	10	10	10+40 =50	10+40 = 50	100
20		20		100		
Nowshera	10	10	10	10+40 =50	10+40 = 50	100
20		20		100		
Swabi	10	10	10	10+40 =50	10+40 = 50	100
20		20		100		
G. Total	50+50= 100	50+50=100		100+400=500	500	

Pilot Testing

Pilot study was conducted and tool's reliability through Cronbach's Alpha coefficient was found to be .783 and thus data was collected. To analyze the data chi-square were used through SPSS version 21. When the calculated chi-square value was found greater than the tabulated value ($X^2= 3.841$) at 0.05 level of significance, the statement supported, when it is found to be less than tabulated the statement was not supported.

IV. ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

Table 3: Management weaknesses

Respondents	SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score 1	25	11	11	2	50		37.200	.000
	%age 2%	50%	22%	22%	4%	100%	4		
Female (Heads)	Score 2	20	10	15	3			23.800	.000
	%age 4%	40%	20%	30%	6%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$

Table 3 denotes that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 37.200 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 23.800, which was found greater than critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was

calculated $\chi^2 \geq \chi^2_{0.05, (4)} = 9.488$. Therefore, in both of the cases statement “Management weaknesses were pointed out and removed” was supported.

Table 4: Enrolment of students were increased

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	27	18	1	3	1	50		56.400	.000
	%age	54%	36%	2%	6%	2%	100%	4		
Female (Heads)	Score	25	22	1	1	1			56.400	.000
	%age	50%	44%	2%	2%	2%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2_{0.05, (4)} = 9.488$

Table 4 reveals that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 56.400 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 56.400, which was found greater than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \geq \chi^2_{0.05, (4)} = 9.488$. Therefore, in both of the cases statement “Enrolment of students was increased” was supported.

Table 5 Teachers punctuality was improved through IMU system

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	4	38	1	5	2	50		12.735	.000
	%age	8%	76%	2%	10%	4%	100%	4		
Female (Heads)	Score	5	24	15	6	0			15.400	.000
	%age	10%	48%	30%	12%	0%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2_{0.05, (4)} = 9.488$

Table 5 indicates that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 12.735 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 15.400, which was found greater than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \geq \chi^2_{0.05, (4)} = 9.488$. Therefore, in both of the cases statement “Use of Information Technology was increased at Elementary Level schools” was supported

Table 6: Libraries/IT-Lab were functionalized in Elementary schools

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	4	38	1	5	2	50		8.950	.000
	%age	8%	76%	2%	10%	4%	100%	4		
Female (Heads)	Score	5	24	15	6	0			5.950	.000
	%age	10%	48%	30%	12%	0%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2_{0.05, (4)} = 9.488$

Table 6 indicates that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 8.950 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 5.950, which was found less than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \leq \chi^2_{0.05, (4)} = 9.488$. Therefore, in the both of the cases the statement “Libraries were functionalized in Elementary schools” was not supported.

Table 7: PTC was functionalized and strengthened

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	6	18	17	6	3	50		19.400	.000
	%age	12%	36%	34%	12%	6%	100%	4		
Female (Heads)	Score	11	17	3	12	7			11.200	.000
	%age	22%	34%	6%	24%	14%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2_{0.05, (4)} = 9.488$

Table 7 expounds that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 19.400 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 11.200, which was found greater than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \geq \chi^2_{0.05, (4)} = 9.488$. Therefore, in both of the cases statement “PTC was functionalized and strengthened” was supported.

Table 8: Provision of basic facilities were ensured

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	17	16	14	1	2	50	4	24.600	.000
	%age	34%	32%	28%	2%	4%	100%			
Female (Heads)	Score	7	20	17	6	0			11.920	.000
	%age	14%	40%	34%	12%	0%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$

Table 8 expounds that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 24.600 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 11.920, which was found greater than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \geq \chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$. Therefore, in both of the cases statement "Provision of basic facilities were ensured" was supported.

Table 9: Teachers were satisfied with their pay packages

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	11	10	8	17	7	50	4	3.000	.000
	%age	22%	20%	16%	34%	14%	100%			
Female (Heads)	Score	10	10	7	16	7			4.960	.000
	%age	20%	20%	14%	42%	14%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$

Table 9 indicates that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 3.000 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 5.400, which was found less than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \leq \chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$. Therefore, in both of the cases statement "Teachers were satisfied with their pay packages" was not supported.

Table 10: Six months Induction training program after recruitment

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	8	11	7	12	7	50	4	29.600	.000
	%age	16%	22%	14%	24%	14%	100%			
Female (Heads)	Score	13	24	7	5	1			32.000	.000
	%age	26%	48%	14%	10%	2%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$

Table 10 denotes that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 29.600 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 32.000. The calculated chi-square value for male respondents was smaller than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. While the calculated χ^2 value for female respondents were greater than the critical value (9.488) at degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. Therefore, in the cases of male the statement "Six months pre-service mandatory training program after recruitment will be more productive for quality education" was not supported while in the case of female it was supported.

Table 11: Teachers recruitment and selection process was improved

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	Df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	16	31	1	1	1	50	4	72.000	.000
	%age	8%	76%	2%	10%	4%	100%			
Female (Heads)	Score	19	28	2	1	0			42.000	.000
	%age	38%	56%	4%	2%	0%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$

Table 11 describes that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 72.000 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 42.000 which was found greater than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \geq \chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$. Therefore, in the cases of male the statement "Teachers recruitment and selection process was improved" was not supported while in the case of female it was supported.

Table 12: Induction of female teachers at primary level produced more productive effects at foundation level

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	Df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	7	34	4	2	3	50		73.400	.000
	%age	14%	78%	8%	4	6%	100%	4		
Female (Heads)	Score	13	26	9	1	1			42.800	.000
	%age	16%	52%	18%	2%	2%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$

Table 12 reveals that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 73.400 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 42.800, which was found greater than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \geq \chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$. Therefore, in the both of the cases the statement “Induction of female teachers at primary level produced more productive effects at foundation level” was supported.

Table 13: Introduction of ethical programs were helpful in producing good citizens

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	22	8	1	15	4	50		29.000	.000
	%age	44%	16%	2%	30%	8%	100%	4		
Female (Heads)	Score	13	24	9	4	0			17.360	.000
	%age	26%	48%	18	8%	0%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$

Table 13 indicates that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 29.000 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 17.360, which was found greater than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \geq \chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$. Therefore, in both of the cases statement “Introduction of ethical programs was helpful in producing good citizens” was supported.

Table 14: Course contents/ syllabi were made SLO based

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	22	6	6	10	6	50		19.200	.000
	%age	44%	13%	12%	20%	12%	100%	4		
Female (Heads)	Score	17	29	4	0	0			18.760	.000
	%age	34%	58%	8%	0%	0%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$

Table 14 describes that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 19.200 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 18.760, which was found greater than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \geq \chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$. Therefore, in both of the cases statement “Course contents/ syllabi were made SLO based” was supported.

Table 15: Diversification of subjects enhanced the learning of students at

Elementary level

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	6	17	21	4	2	50		28.600	.000
	%age	12%	34%	42%	8%	4%	100%	4		
Female (Heads)	Score	5	31	7	7	0			36.720	.000
	%age	10%	62%	24%	14%	0%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$

Table 15 expounds that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 28.600 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 36.720, which was found greater than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \geq \chi^2 0.05, (4) = 9.488$. Therefore, in both of the cases statement “Diversification of subjects enhanced the learning of students at Elementary level” was supported.

Table 16: Effective utilization of resources was ensured

Respondents		SA	A	UD	DA	SDA	Total	df	X2	p-value
Male (Heads)	Score	8	10	9	16	7	50	4	5.000	.000
	%age	16%	20%	18%	34%	14%	100%			
Female (Heads)	Score	9	10	7	17	7	50	4	6.860	.000
	%age	18%	20%	14%	34%	14%	100%			

$\alpha = 0.05$

$\chi^2_{0.05, (4)} = 9.488$

Table 16 indicates that the chi-square value for male respondents was calculated 5.000 while for the female respondents the chi-square value was calculated 6.800, which was found less than the critical value (9.488) at the degree of freedom 4 and Alpha (α) 0.05. In both case the chi-square value was calculated $\chi^2 \leq \chi^2_{0.05, (4)} = 9.488$. Therefore, in both of the cases statement “Effective utilization of resources was ensured” was not supported.

On the basis of analysis of the statements, interpretation and discussion, the following conclusions were drawn. The findings of the study can be divided into four sections; Management/ Managerial Reforms, Curricular Reforms, Teacher Education Reforms and Infrastructural Reforms.

V. FINDINGS

1. The results revealed that both of the male and female heads/ in-charge opined that management weaknesses were pointed out and removed.
2. The results of the study showed that both of the respondent were of the opinion that the enrollment of students was increased.
3. The study revealed that the teachers’ punctuality was improved through IMU system. Both of the respondents agreed to the statement.
4. The study shows that both of the respondents reject the statement that effective utilization of resources was ensured. In each of case the calculated chi-square was found to be less than the table value.
5. The results shows that both of the respondents were of the opinion that diversification of subjects enhanced the learning of students at Elementary level
6. The study revealed that course contents/ syllabi were made SLO (Students Learning Outcomes) based.
7. Most of the respondents were of the opinion that the introduction of ethical programs was helpful in producing good citizens.
8. The results showed that that induction of female teachers at primary level produced more productive effects at foundation (primary) level. Both of the respondents supported the statement.
9. Both of the heads/ in-charges’ respondents agreed to the statements that the teachers recruitment and selection process was merit based
10. The results showed that the male heads approved the statement that the six months pre-service mandatory training program after recruitment will be more productive for quality education while the female respondents discard it.
11. The results showed that both of the respondents i.e. male and female heads/ in-charges were not satisfied with their pay packages.
12. The results showed that both of the respondents stamped the statement that provision of basic facilities were ensured.
13. The results showed that the male respondents were of the opinion that the libraries were functionalized not in Elementary schools. They rejected the statement.
14. The study indicated that the respondents supported the statement that parent teachers counsel was functionalized and strengthened.

The way forward

1. The government may pay due concentration for the professional development of the teachers at elementary level, because this is base of other modes of education.
2. The teachers may focus their attention on the development of student in the light of SLOs as planned by the government in the new era.
3. The monitoring system is a good step in the development of quality education, therefore, it is recommended that further transparency may be brought in this new system to ensure the punctuality and regularity of the teachers in school.
4. Parent Teacher Council is an excellent step toward higher achievement. The school Heads may come out from black and white activities, but pragmatic approach based on ground realities is the crying

need of the time because without involvement of the parents in the grooming process of the students, everything is futile.

5. The basic facilities like libraries, IT Lab, soft drinking water, furnished washrooms, and even students' chairs are not available in Primary schools while Middle schools are better than primary concerning ground realities but on paper all these facilities are available. The all stakeholders may focus in effect on these matters.

6. The inflation is skyrocketing with the passage of time. The teachers are not satisfied from the pay packages, therefore, the government may deal this matter on humanitarian basis.

7. The Heads of the schools may be provided with trainings on leadership and management to remove weaknesses and bring improvement in managerial skills.

REFERENCES

1. Adejumobi, F.T., & ojikutu, R.K. (2013). School Climate and Teachers' Job Performance in Lagos state Nigeria. *Discourse Journal of Educational Research*, 1(2), 26-36.S
2. Adelman, H.S, & Taylor, L. (2007). Systemic Change for School Improvement University of California, Los Angeles. *Journal of Educational and Psychological Consultation*, 17(1), 55-77. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.
3. Amin, U.R., Ayaz, & Amer, A. (2013). Teachers' job Performance at secondary level in K.P.K, Pakistan. *Gomal University Journal of Research*, 29 (2), 100-104.
4. Aziz. M., Bloom. D. E., Humair. S., Jimenez. E., Rosenberg. L., Sathar. Z. (2014). *Education System Reform in Pakistan: Why, When, and How?* Bonn, Germany. IZA.
5. Cerghit, I., (2008), *Sisteme de instruire alternative şicomplementare. Structuri, stiluri, strategii*, Polirom Publishing House, Iasi
6. DoES. (2017). *Action Plan for Education 2017*: Department of education and skills. Ireland Gf
7. Daria Tot. (2014). Monitoring and Self-Evaluating Teacher's Professional Development and School Activities, *Životiškola*, br. 31 (1/2014.) god. 60. str. 176. – 190.
8. Erdem, M., Ilgan, A., & Ucar, H. (2014). Relationship between Learning Organization and Job Satisfaction of primary School Teachers. *International Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 6(1), 8-20.
9. Ghavifekr, S. & Rosdy, W.A.W. (2015). Teaching and learning with technology: Effectiveness of ICT integration in schools. *International Journal of Research in Education and Science (IJRES)*, 1(2), 175-191
10. Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Education. (2008). *Education for all: Mid-decade assessment (country report)*. Islamabad: Ministry of Education (p.11-15)
11. Iqbal, K., Suleman, Q. & Irshadullah, M.H. (2017). Understanding the Formative Assessment: A Road Towards Targets Achievements: *Journal of Education and Practice*, ISSN 2222-1735 (Paper) ISSN 2222-288X (Online). Vol.8, No.28, 2017
12. Khan, A.S, Ayaz, M., Ullah, M., Khan, M.S., Ullah, W., Zahidullah&Shahid, M. (2017). Role Of IMI in Enrollment at Primary Level in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa: *Sci.Int. (Lahore)*, 29(6), 1241-1244, 2017ISSN 1013-5316; CODEN: SINTE 8
13. Popkewitz, T. S. (2002): *Critical theories in education: changing terrains of knowledge and politics*. New York: Routledge.
14. Rosen, J. A. (2012). Non cognitive Skills in the Classroom - New Perspectives on Educational Research RTI International Retrieved from: <https://www.rti.org/pubs/bk-0004-1009-rosen.pdf>.
15. Saigol, R. (2002). Enemies within and Enemies Without: The Besieged Self in Pakistani Textbooks', paper presented at the Library of Congress Workshop, Washington, D.C. October 2002. Printed in Akbar Zaidi (ed.), *Social Science in Pakistan in the 1990s*, as 'History, Social Studies, Civics and the Creation of Enemies', (Islamabad: Council of Social Sciences, 2003).
16. Yara, P. O. & Otieno, O. K. (2012). Teaching/learning resources and academic performance in mathematics in secondary schools in Bondo district of Kenya. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*. 6(12):1-6.
17. Zembylas, M., & Papanastasiou, E. (2015). Modeling Teachers Empowerment: The Role of Job Satisfaction. *Educational Research and Evaluation*, 11(5), 433-459.