



Sustainable Education Development in Indonesia: Is Education Ready for Online Learning?

Mario Nugroho Willyarto, Language Center, Industrial Engineering Department, Faculty of Humanities, Bina Nusantara University, Jakarta, Indonesia, mario.nugroho@binus.ac.id

Arsiyanti Lestari, Communication Department, Faculty of Economic and Communication, Bina Nusantara University, Jakarta, Indonesia, arsiyanti.lestari@binus.ac.id

Siswantini, Communication Department, Faculty of Economic and Communication, Bina Nusantara University, Jakarta, Indonesia, siswantini@binus.ac.id

Virienia Puspita, Communication Department, Faculty of Economic and Communication, Bina Nusantara University, Jakarta, Indonesia, virienia@binus.ac.id

Abstract- During COVID-19 pandemic, all learning teaching process were conducted from home using online learning. This research discussed how students and teachers/lecturers' experience could build a meaningful online learning process. The method used was interpretative qualitative approach. Three teachers/lecturers and two students were interviewed. This study was focusing on whether the 'forced' online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic, could give benefits for teaching learning process by teachers/lecturers to students. A bigger question was about to be answered: Is Education Ready for Online Learning? The result showed there were a lot of things must be prepared to conduct Online Learning. Even though education was not ready yet, Online Learning must be conducted during this COVID-19 pandemic to facilitate the learning process. The conclusion was that all parties (lecturers/teachers/students/parents /institutions/government) must improve their knowledge, skills and attitude toward the new system, provide adequate infrastructures, regulations and curriculum in order to run Online Learning well.

Keywords: online learning, COVID-19, lecturers, teachers, students.

I. INTRODUCTION

At the end of year 2019, the world had been shocked by the outbreak of corona virus or known as corona virus disease 2019 (COVID-19), that spread widely and very fast to many areas around the globe. WHO Director-General in his regular media briefing stated that WHO has been assessing this outbreak around the clock and were deeply concerned both by the alarming levels of spread and severity, and by the alarming levels of inaction. WHO therefore had made the assessment that COVID-19 could be characterized as a pandemic [1]. In order to minimize the spreading of the virus, many countries implemented a lockdown system, quarantine procedures or physical/social distancing while maintaining personal hygiene for their people. Almost all countries were applying 'stay at home' strategy for people, work and learn from home.

Education institutions such as schools and universities were supporting this government policy by conducting Online Learning, teaching and learning from home. Although not all education institutions were ready for Online Learning, but because of the pandemic, they were forced to work/teach/learn from home by using Online Learning. Some universities have been doing Online Learning for a certain time before, so they were not having too many difficulties in doing it. But, others, who have not used Online Learning before, they were struggling to shift from face-to-face classroom to a virtual classroom. Whether ready or not, the show must go on.

All schools and universities across the world announced that they were moving to online-only learning. Hundreds of thousands of teachers were busy working to move their face-to-face lessons online. Designing online courses took significant time and effort [2]. When institutions started sending students and professors home due to COVID-19, more than a few academics opined on social media that this would be a boon for research productivity: the idea, presumably, was that isolation breeds creativity [3]. Switching to virtual education may be one method to reduce the spread of coronavirus, but this move also could cause challenges for students who were not able to access internet-based education. In recognition of increased reliance on internet access for many students participating in online learning, some internet service providers have altered their policies, raised internet connection speeds and eliminated data caps [4]. Many schools were in poor broadband areas or support communities without the resources necessary

for continued online learning. Some of these schools were considering whether they could provide robust remote learning, limited supplemental learning, or whether they would close the school temporarily. Any remote services would vary by school and might evolve over time. While some schools were preparing to provide an equivalent education to students during quarantine or shutdown, others were preparing to provide a few hours of continued learning or time for connection and socialization [5].

This study was focusing on whether the 'forced' online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic, could give benefits for teaching learning process by teachers/lecturers to students. All parties should be directed to the things that are positive and supporting the students in learning [6]. How the teachers/lecturers provided a meaningful learning process for students, since there would be abundance works for students who took a lot of subjects? How the students proceed with online learning instead of face-to-face session in order to gain knowledge and good academic performance as well? All those questions were to answer a bigger inquiry whether education ready for online learning, and to recommend what must be done/prepared to conduct online learning so that lecturers/teachers/students could get benefit from it. It is not only moving the classroom into virtual room, but more about shifting paradigm, either for lectures, teachers, students, institutions and society.

II. LITERATURE REVIEWS

Tu & McIsaac (2002)'s study showed that social presence was an important factor in improving instructional effectiveness and building a sense of community. Garrison & Cleveland-Innes (2005) studies found that teaching presence in the form of facilitation is also crucial to the success of online learning and thus suggest that instructors play a leadership role in triggering discussion and facilitating higher levels of thinking and knowledge construction. Furthermore, Wu and Hiltz (2004) in their research showed that online teachers needed to structure the interaction, give students more guidance and devote enough time to ensure that students could reach a high level of critical thinking and knowledge construction. Garrison, Anderson, and Archer (2001) suggested that cognitive presence could be created and supported in online environments with appropriate teaching and social presence [7].

Alqurashi said in his research that it was also more likely to have high student satisfaction and perceived learning rates if students had high quality and quantity interactions with their instructor. This included asking and answering questions, receiving feedback, and participating in online discussions. In online learning environments, the instructor's response and feedback were essential due to the lack of face-to-face communication [8].

Motivation is why individuals behave, think and have feelings in a way that they do, with emphasis on the activation and direction of behavior. When students are motivated, they will do something, they demonstrated active behavior [9]. Another research about motivation also mentioned that students with stronger learning motivation also tend to engage in course tasks and group activities more actively. It is thus vital for course designers to consider how learning motivation can be enhanced throughout the different stages of the course, from the initial enrolment to the course setting facilitation [10].

The results of the TOST indicated that the difference occurred between the confidence intervals, meaning that both the online and face-to-face conditions may be considered equivalent for both long-term gain scores and final posttest scores within the established zone of indifference. This information shows that online learning can be viable method of learning for middle school students regarding both mathematical knowledge retention and achievement [11].

A research done by Dzemiđoc Kristiansen et al came to a conclusion that the complex relationships between cooperating students, the present review aims to identify factors of students' face-to-face promotive interaction (FtFPI) might lead to successful cooperative learning (CL) in small group. Reviewing 34 peer reviewed articles, the findings illustrated such key factors as students' interpersonal behavior, experiences, communication and support, and teachers' influence, all of which underpin the FtFPI process and in turn can lead to deep learning. The review suggested that both teachers and students must prepare well in order to achieve successful CL implementation with respect to the complex issue of FtFPI in CL [12].

Online studies offer many students, particularly those who are older with responsibilities of family and work, the opportunity they need to be able to study towards a university degree, acknowledging that

family members, friends and colleagues, play a crucial role in providing first-in-family students with inspiration, encouragement and ongoing support [13].

The concept of computer-based learning was a form of learning model by utilizing web and internet technologies, the concept of learning and teaching was not new, not even new ideas or thoughts, even has developed since a few decades ago. The results of the process and results of teaching and learning can be stored in data in the form of databases, which can be used to repeat the past teaching-learning process as a reference, so that it can be produced a better subject matter content. [14].

Joan Borg Marks in his study said it is important that teachers learn how to best search/probe students' alternative ideas early so that teachers can try to direct students' learning towards the scientific view, to be careful on how to use models and analogies systematically to help student understanding, allowing students to be creative, allowing students to be creative as they progress towards understanding the scientific view. It is important for teachers to use methods of teaching which include guided discussion in the classroom, students' drawings, pictures, simulations and hands-on experiences [15].

The online environment is different from the traditional face-to-face environment and hence the tools and teaching techniques used in the traditional face-to-face classroom cannot be directly applied to the online classes. These tools and techniques must be modified to accommodate for the lack of physical proximity experienced in an online course

[16]. Further study had provided evidence on how the adoption of an online learning platform together with an appropriate strategic framework and pedagogical approaches could benefit students' intercultural learning without leaving their respective hometowns [17].

A study by Gray and DiLoreto indicated that it was possible that as a result of such consistency among the structure of the courses, students believe that this is an extremely important aspect to improving their learning [18].

III. METHOD

This study was using an interpretative qualitative approach to describe certain social conditions in accordance with the purpose. It was also to investigate an effective learning process done in online learning. The interpretative qualitative approach with the main data sources were interviews and direct observation in the field. Like the other design of qualitative research, the aim was to get cases that were considered had rich information to achieve saturated data. The important thing for researchers was to maintain a sampling strategy to fulfill the purpose of study [19]. In this study, 3 teachers/lecturers and 2 students were interviewed. Some questions were given to teachers/lecturers/students such as: What do you miss about face-to-face courses when you are in an online course? What do you miss about an online course when you are in a face-to-face course? How important is the connection feeling with others when you are in class together? What suggestions would you give to a student who is doing an online learning for the first time? What suggestions would you give to teachers/lecturers teaching online learning? [20]. How do you describe successful online learning? How do you get the support you need? [21]. Are you sure you will perform better in online learning?

The analysis was aimed at extracting themes, structures, interactions and performances from stories or accounts that people use to explain their past, their present situation or their interpretations of events [22]. The data, which was primarily aural, was collected by semi - or unstructured interviews, participant observation or other undirected methods. It analyzed for different aspects, such as what was said rather than how, or conversely, the nature of the performance during the telling, and perhaps how the storyteller reacted with the listener(s). The structure of the story was inspected. All this was done in order to reveal the undercurrents that might lie under the simple interview.

Communicating results and describing in detail on how the research conducted were critical last steps in the process. The norm of communalism emphasized that the publication of the research would be done on how the research conducted and its complete findings. Conducting a study and reporting its results could create controversy. Doing research could raise contentious ethical issues that largely involve protecting research participants, maintaining integrity while doing research, and dealing with pressure from research sponsors. Social research also involves political issues that could be even more contentious. The politics of social research could affect the possibility of conducting a study and disseminating findings

from it as well as how others may try to misuse research findings [23]. The report of this research was made in regards of the informants' right. The name was disguised in accordance to informants' will. The report would then be published in international journal/proceeding in order to disseminate the research. Hopefully the result could be useful for researchers and audience around the world.

IV. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

There were three teachers, and two students were interviewed. Questions as mentioned above were asked. Their answers were summarized in this section.

The first informant was Alreen. She was a lecturer in one of the private universities in Jakarta, Indonesia. She liked to interact with college students, and while interacting in face-to-face learning, she could get a fast feedback from her students. A quick respond always she got from students in the classroom. It was very interesting to conduct an intense two-way communication when meeting physically with them. In Online Learning, it was very difficult to know whether the students were paying attention or not, especially those who were not connecting through video call during virtual conferences. Arleen continued, even while having video conference, it was not sure if the students were not doing anything else outside the screen. It looked like face to face meetings, but using technology, and it was losing the real sense of communication in virtual meetings. It is important for students to pay attention to make sure transfer of knowledge during lessons. She suggested for the first-timer students in Online Learning to learn how to focus and concentrate to the explanation from the teacher/lecturer. She added that it is very good to implement the teaching method that engage students by giving them questions, explore more tools to make the process more interactive. On the other side, she said, the infra-structure must be planned as well. The internet connections must be adequate to run a video call conference, the more powerful computer the better and surely the teacher/lecturer/s preparation at least one day before. Arleen mentioned that she was not sure whether the Online Learning could give an effective way of learning, hopefully it would.

Reni was the second informant who was working as a teacher. She said that most parents were actively involved in their children's academic achievements. In face-to-face classroom, it was easy to deliver the instructions, giving direct feedback on students' work/responses, and it is very important to do. Students learn a lot from teacher's feedbacks. She gave an advice for the first-timer student in Online Learning, that one must try their best independently. It might take time and feel uncomfortable to learn something without the teacher by student's side. Students would loose direct interaction with their teachers, especially for younger age students. 'Take it as a switch off and on of the old fashion way', she added. For teachers, the best way to deliver Online Learning is to encourage and give constructive feedbacks to students' responses. Scoring and covering the whole curriculum might not be necessary as long as teachers see the students are enjoying the Online Learning engagements. According to Reni, a successful Online Learning was occurred when student's independence learning is balanced with parents' involvement. The Online Learning that she did was supported by her own wifi, smartphone, anchor charts, and computer. She was sure that Online Learning is effective for students to perform well in academics. Therefore, she mentioned, to be able to run Online Learning, one must make sure that everything needed for it was provided well, especially the internet connection. The poor internet connection will ruin the whole process of Online Learning.

Joan was a teacher in a private school, was voluntarily to be the third informant for this research. Her experience in Online Learning was giving her a fast pace of working. Discussing and checking on students' works were faster if compared to face-to-face class. She was sure that it was because the students were assisted by their parents at home. During the period of learning from home because of this COVID-19 pandemic, made her missed the quality time with her students, colleagues and school environment. According to her, it is very important for having a good relationship with students during face-to-face lessons, because teaching is not only about transferring knowledge by more about making professional relationship with them as well. As a teacher, one also has to build students' good characters and attitude as well, which cannot be done during Online Learning. Another thing about Online Learning was it is almost impossible to engage a learning process while the students are not feeling well, especially during video conference call. Since it was in a pandemic condition that forcing everyone to work and learn from home, it was good to always improve ones' skill to do whatever it took to conduct Online Learning, even if the program or application were not familiar, but one would always be able to learn to use it, just don't

give up, give the best and keep the faith, she added. In her opinion, a successful Online Learning is when her students understand the lesson and are happy. In order to conduct Online Learning, Joan were using her own computer, wifi in her boarding house, free worksheets from the internet and she brought home some books from the school. She was quite sure that Online Learning was an effective way for teaching learning process.

The fourth informant was coming from a secondary level student from a private school. Arletta was a student who was very excited doing Online Learning, especially in this 'learn from home' period during physical/social distancing to avoid spreading virus in COVID-19 pandemic. When she goes to school, one thing that she had to deal with was coping with the teacher scolding at the whole class when only one single person did something wrong/bad. Although she knew that face-to-face classes are important, she thoroughly prefers online classes. In the interview, she stated that the importance of the connection between each student is according to the personality of the people, if they are bad role models then it is not important. From her experience as a student, one thing she has learned that complaining would make matters worse and made everyone else irritated. "It's better to just go with the flow, you'll get used to it eventually," she added. Although she didn't know much about the teacher's work, she has learned from her parents (who were teachers) that it's better to not stress about the tasks that need to be given out at a small amount of time. She stated that tasks could just be given as small quizzes or projects that would not be much of a hassle to make. In her opinion, a successful online learning is when students can understand the subjects and are comfortable with this situation. She usually only needed wifi, a gadget, and the subject books to be able to do online learning, and all were provided at home. So far, she had no difficulties in following lessons in Online Learning classes, since her parents gave a full support on her needs. Arletta was sure that she could perform better or at least enjoy online learning instead of face-to-face real-life school.

The last but not least informant was an undergraduate student from a private university. This fifth informant was Antonius. He said that most students were having difficulties to focus during Online Learning. There were too many distractions while in video conference, such as poor internet connection, technically problems on gadgets or software and not mentioning the distractions coming from people from his house. The lack of attention from lecturer in Online Learning was discouraging him to study, while he could get more teacher's attention during face-to-face classroom. It gave him more motivation to study. On the other hand, he mentioned, in face-to-face learning, usually lecturers are using the old fashion way such as whiteboard and books in teaching, not even using technology at all or other supporting facilities. In his experience of study, the interactions between students and teachers or among students were very important. The interaction would make the learning process become easier and smoother. The discussions during face-to-face learning would support the process of learning on some topics in some subjects. His suggestion for the first-timer students doing Online Learning was to have motivation before joining one. Thus, try to the best while doing it independently or assisted by their parents and do all works given to the best. According to Antonius, it was good if lecturers/teachers prepare the topics, tasks and tests before having the video conference. The preparation of administration on providing Online Learning was made accordingly by the institutions, schools or universities.

It is best to use all support such as technology to deliver topics, not only giving homework or giving the topics without explanation. He mentioned that the successful Online Learning is occurred when lecturers/teachers deliver the topics well and interesting so that students can understand, do the homework or the test well, and finally get a good score. Some support needed for Online Learning are internet connection, either wifi or internet service provider, gadget such as smartphones or laptops, webcams and microphones. Antonius was not sure whether Online Learning would give an effective learning process during study or not.

Researchers concluded that the development of effective group work was dependent on key principles of relational development, the long-term commitment of teachers, and the ability of teachers and students to turn their classes into cooperative learning environments [12]. Therefore, the interaction between teachers, teacher – student, and students would create positive impact on children's mental development through education. As Arleen and Reni experienced, that interaction with students while having face-to-face learning was interesting. They could get direct response from students, saw students' reaction and emotion and build a good rapport with students. From the students' point of view, they could get immediate feedback from teachers. As Antonius respond, that it would be best for one's education development if there is a good interaction with teacher during lessons in the school. The social interaction

between everyone in the class or school would encourage people to achieve better when it was a positive encouraging environment, this is in line with Arletta statement as the informant of the research. Joan's feeling of missing the quality time with students, colleagues and school was because she had a good time during social relationship in the school. Based on the social needs as human beings, man still need face-to-face learning to develop themselves.

With the adoption of the 'Internationalization at Home' (IaH) approach [17], students did not need to travel overseas to develop their intercultural competence. Students were able to experience interacting with international students without having to leave their home countries and could be achieved in either formal or informal learning environment. With the advancement of technology, communication may take place online in a virtual platform for Online Learning. Arleen's concern was in students' concentration and focus during Online Learning, similar with Antonius who said that there were a lot of distraction factors when attending Online Learning. It is difficult to develop a good rapport between teacher and student, the attention of teachers cannot be shown directly even though students need to feel safe and cared by the teachers, as Reni commented. Unlike the other informants, the only one who was very excited doing Online Learning was Arletta. She could get along with face-to-face learning and Online Learning, she thought that the Online Learning was another method in learning that she has never had in face-to-face classroom. Therefore, she was very enthusiast in learning using another way, a new method for her. She liked doing Online Learning and able to follow all lessons well. In her case, further research needs to be conducted among students in the same level or school with regard of the children cognitive and mental development. Most of the informants had similar opinions that Online Learning lost the humanity sense for both teacher and student.

Students need to make some adjustment in doing Online Learning, because it is very much different if compared with face-to-face learning. One of the challenges of Online Learning relates to students feeling disconnected to their classmates and instructor. The presence of an instructor had a statistically significant impact on perceived student learning [18].

The role of lecturers or teachers or instructors was very crucial in conducting Online Learning. It is important for educators (lecturers/teachers/trainers/instructors) to develop an interesting method of teaching to engage students so that students can follow and learn to their best. Institution should provide trainings for educators to improve their skills. Improving external factors to improve teachers' competence is important, such as by always motivating the teachers make innovation by innovation, motivating the teachers to have the best result orientation in his/her job, motivating the teachers' habit to have team work orientation, empowering the teachers [24]. Arleen, one of the research informants, to engage students during Online Learning could be done by giving questions that make students think in such a way to make it simple. Small quizzes or projects would do, within a short time, according to Arletta, since there will be a lot of tasks from different subjects to be done by students. Reni's idea regarding the school curriculum, was not relevant during the COVID-19 pandemic, since it was an emergency situation, while the curriculum was made for normal condition. Teachers need to do a well preparation, topics, tasks and tests before having the video conference. The institution should support the educators in preparation and administration. Antonius commented that it is best when educators use all means of communication during Online Learning rather than just giving homework without explanation.

The infrastructure and support for technology must be provided either from the institutions or the government. Online Learning will be done well when the internet connection, gadget and software are running smoothly. From all five informants, almost all of them were quite sure that Online Learning will be effective for learning, in term of score achievement for students.

V. CONCLUSION

From the results of this research, all informants had similar argumentation that learning process still need the physical attendance to develop social skill for students as well as educators. Attention, emotion, empathy, sympathy is still needed by students to feel save and cared, so that students can learn best in that conducive learning environment. Students cannot get this environment in Online Learning. Educators were not ready with the resources and technology, institutions were not ready for the regulations and government was not ready with curriculum, infrastructures and facilities. Even though most of informants were assuming that Online Learning would be effective, still the fact that men as social being could not be neglected.

In the current situation, during COVID-19 pandemic, where everyone is at home for quarantine or lockdown, whether ready or not, schools and universities must conduct Online Learning. With the lack of knowledge on Online Learning, facilities, infrastructures and mentality, all parties were rushed to do Online Learning because the formal learning process could not be postponed. Therefore, to answer the bigger inquiry as mentioned above, education is not ready for Online Learning yet. Even in this emergency situation, Online Learning seemed to be 'forced' conducted with minimum tools, software and bandwidth (when everyone was joining Online Learning, the internet connection became slower). It will need more time to prepare and do researches for the world to be able to conduct Online Learning well.

This research can be continued for more informants or to find out a better way to conduct Online Learning. It could be more specific (eq. for certain level of education) to create regulations and curriculum that fit with Online Learning. It might also be the basic for further research to find solution for education in general.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This research was funded by Binus University, Jakarta as the International Research Scheme, with contract number: No.026/VR.RTT/IV/2020, date: 6 April 2020

REFERENCES

- [1] World Health Organization, "The Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19): Situation report-36," 2020. doi: 10.3928/19382359-20200219-01.
- [2] Kyungmee Lee, "COVID-19: 14 simple tips for better online teaching," 2020. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/life/2020/03/27/covid-19-14-simple-tips-for-better-online-teaching.html>.
- [3] B. C. Flaherty, "Faculty Home Work," 2020. <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2020/03/24/working-home-during-covid-19-proves-challenging-faculty-members> (accessed Mar. 28, 2020).
- [4] "COVID-19 Update," 2020. <https://www.ecs.org/covid-19-update/>.
- [5] Megan Mann, "Coronavirus (COVID-19) Guidance for Schools," 2020. <https://www.nais.org/articles/pages/additional-covid-19-guidance-for-schools/#remote> (accessed Mar. 28, 2020).
- [6] M. N. Willyarto, "Learning Polygons using English Language," *Humaniora*, vol. 8, no. 4, p. 391, Oct. 2017, doi: 10.21512/humaniora.v8i4.4102.
- [7] W. He, G. Xu, and S. E. Kruck, "Online is education for the 21st century," *J. Inf. Syst. Educ.*, 2014.
- [8] E. Alqurashi, "Predicting student satisfaction and perceived learning within online learning environments," *Distance Educ.*, 2019, doi: 10.1080/01587919.2018.1553562.
- [9] M. N. Willyarto, D. Werhoru, and A. A. Gea, "The use of english in learning mathematics for grade 7 junior high school," in *Proceedings - 2017 International Symposium on Educational Technology, ISET 2017*, Aug. 2017, pp. 177-179, doi: 10.1109/ISET.2017.48.
- [10] K. M. Y. Law, S. Geng, and T. Li, "Student enrollment, motivation and learning performance in a blended learning environment: The mediating effects of social, teaching, and cognitive presence," *Comput. Educ.*, 2019, doi:10.1016/j.compedu.2019.02.021.
- [11] C. M. Edwards, A. C. Rule, and R. M. Boody, "Middle school students' mathematics knowledge retention: Online or face-to-face environments," *Educ. Technol. Soc.*, 2017.
- [12] S. Dzemiđić Kristiansen, T. Burner, and B. H. Johnsen, "Face-to-face promotive interaction leading to successful cooperative learning: A review study," *Cogent Education*. 2019, doi: 10.1080/2331186X.2019.1674067.
- [13] C. Stone, S. O'Shea, J. May, J. Delahunty, and Z. Partington, "Opportunity through online learning: Experiences of first-in-family students in online open-entry higher education," *Aust. J. Adult Learn.*, 2016.
- [14] B. N. Lee, "Computer-based learning: E-learning," *Turkish Online J. Educ. Technol.*, 2017.
- [15] J. Borg Marks, "Models and Modelling for Teacher Courses?," *J. Phys. Conf. Ser.*, 2019, doi: 10.1088/1742-6596/1287/1/012067.
- [16] A. Khan, O. Egbue, B. Palkie, and J. Madden, "Active learning: Engaging students to maximize learning in an online course," *Electron. J. e-Learning*, 2017.
- [17] Lisa Law, Muhammad Hafiz, Theresa Kwong, and Eva Wong, "Evaluating Students' Perceptions on the Effectiveness of Online Intercultural Learning Experience via a SPOC," *Curr. Issues Comp. Educ.*, vol. 21, no. 1, pp. 69-92, 2019, [Online]. Available: http://czoia.com/cice/pdf/5_Lisa-Law,-Muhammad-Hafiz,-Theresa-Kwong,-and-Eva-Wong.pdf.

- [18] J. A. Gray and M. DiLoreto, "The Effects of Student Engagement, Student Satisfaction, and Perceived Learning in Online Learning Environments This," *NCPEA Int. J. Educ. Leadersh. Prep.*, 2016.
- [19] U. Yunus, B. P. Wahyuningtyas, and M. N. Willyarto, "Branding about Indonesia through cross-cultural communication," 2019.
- [20] L. Song, E. S. Singleton, J. R. Hill, and M. H. Koh, "Improving online learning: Student perceptions of useful and challenging characteristics," *Internet High. Educ.*, 2004, doi: 10.1016/j.iheduc.2003.11.003.
- [21] E. Baran, A. P. Correia, and A. D. Thompson, "Tracing successful online teaching in higher education: Voices of exemplary online teachers," *Teach. Coll. Rec.*, 2013.
- [22] N. Walliman, *Research Methods: The Basics*. 2010.
- [23] W. L. Neuman, *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. 2011.
- [24] A. Benawa, A. A. Gea, and M. N. Willyarto, "Improving teacher's commitment by improving external factors," *Adv. Sci. Lett.*, vol. 23, no. 2, pp. 925–928, Feb. 2017, doi: 10.1166/asl.2017.7440.