Pakistani EFL University Students' Perceptions of How Language Anxiety Interacts with Socio-Cultural Factors to Affect their English Learning and Speaking: A Qualitative Analysis

Dr. Abdus Samad, Assistant Professor/Chairman Department of English, Kohat University of Science and Technology, Kohat, PakistanEmail: dr.samad@kust.edu.pk
Dr. Abdul Karim Khan, Assistant Professor, Department of English &Applied Linguistics, UST, Bannu, Pakistan
Dr.IhsanUllah Khan, Assistant Professor, Department of English &Applied Linguistics, UST, Bannu, Pakistan

Abstract: A few anxiety studies have indicated that certain socio-cultural factors, among other factors, could be responsible for students' foreign language speaking anxiety (e.g. Lo, 2017; Yan &Horwitz, 2008). For example, Yan and Horwitz (2008) concluded that future studies should "direct clear attention to the sociocultural factors associated with language learning." (p.175). A careful review of language anxiety research reveals that the majority of studies in this field have associated language anxiety with factors such as linguistics-related, classroom-related, teacher-related and student-related. Very little attention has been paid to date in relation to students' immediate socio-cultural contexts. In particular, to the best of my knowledge, no study in Pakistan has examined these factors in relation to anxiety. This study attempts to fill this gap by investigating the perspectives of Pakistani EFL university students about socio-cultural factors that could cause their speaking anxiety (SA). Semi-structured Interviews were utilised as a data collection tool. The data were collected from five university departments, each in a different public sector university in Pakistan. The sample comprised 20 postgraduate non-English major Pakistani male and female students, four from each university. The data were analysed through exploratory content analysis. The data reveal a number of socio-cultural-related sources of SA including students' geographic background, students' pre-university English education, the role of students' parents, social and cultural trends, cultural alienation, and mixed-gender classrooms. It appears that these sources of SA have not been previously reported upon in the literature. Therefore, this study may serve as an index for future writers. This study contributes to the existing knowledge by suggesting that language anxiety can be investigated beyond the cognitive and psychological dimensions. Finally, implications and suggestions for further studies are offered.

Keywords: language learning, speaking anxiety (SA), socio-cultural factors

I. INTRODUCTION

Due to the important role played by English, especially in communicating scientific and technological information, proficiency in the English language is viewed by many as a prerequisite for economic development at national as well as international levels. Following this trend, in Pakistan, English is regarded as, "the language for development at both the individual and national levels" (Shamim, 2011:293). Shamim&Tribble (2005) note that there is a recognition of the importance of English and a clear desire for learning it amongst all sections of the population in Pakistan, particularly in higher education institutions. Thus, all stakeholders put effort, time and money into achieving proficiency. The development of spoken proficiency is considered by Pakistani students and parents a very important reason for studying English (Malik et al., 2020).Ghani (2003) considers that those who can speak English are regarded as socially and intellectually superior. Despite the reasons for motivation and effort described, the current speaking proficiency level of most university students in Pakistan is not considered to be satisfactory (Ahmad &Rao, 2013; Shahbaz, 2012). Therefore, in view of its usefulness for Pakistani students, it seems imperative to identify and tackle the factors that may affect and interfere with their spoken English skills.

Several factors may contribute to the poor speaking skills of Pakistani EFL students. Following Arnold & Brown (1999:8), an individual's, "anxiety is quite possibly the affective factor that most pervasively obstructs the learning process". Similarly, Liu & Huang (2011) assert that foreign language anxiety (FLA) is the most significant predictor of learners' performance among the affective variables. Gardner (1991: vii) also notes that, "language anxiety is a pervasive and prominent force in the language learning context".Thus, the current study attempts to investigate anxiety as a possible factor interfering with Pakistani students' English speaking.

Rationale for the Study

Firstly, many Pakistani ELT professionals have noted that English language teaching in general remains an under-developed and under-researched area in Pakistan (e.g. Malik et al., 2020; Shahbaz, 2012; Islam, 2013). Following this, even fewer studies have been conducted to explore FLA in Pakistan; it is a relatively new and under-researched area. The present study attempts to fill the gap that currently exists concerning the understanding of speaking anxiety (SA) in the Pakistani context. Secondly, Lo's (2017) study highlighted that certain socio-cultural factors, among other factors, may be responsible for students' SA. Thus, he suggested that these factors may be examined in relation to anxiety. Likewise, Yan and Horwitz's (2008) study indicated that socio-cultural factors may invoke SA for students thus the writers concluded that future studies should "direct clear attention to the sociocultural factors associated with language learning." (p.175). A careful review of anxiety literature suggests that most of the studies in this field have associated anxiety with linguistics-related, classroom-related, teacher-related and student-related factors. Very little attention has been paid to date in examining anxiety in relation to such socio-cultural factors in this field. In particular, no study in Pakistan has examined these factors in relation to anxiety. This study attempts to fill this gap by investigating socio-cultural factors responsible for students' SA.

Research Question

What socio-cultural factors do students believe contribute to foreign language speaking anxiety in Pakistani EFL university classrooms?

Potential Significance of the Study

This study intends to provide useful recommendations to enable Pakistani teachers to respond to their students' SA and to help teachers to organise their classes in a manner which may reduce their students' SA and promote students' speaking. It is hoped that the results of this research may provide valuable insights to educational/language policy-makers and designers of educational materials in Pakistan, enabling them to plan, design, manage, and assess programmes in such a way as to further reduce students' SA. From a theoretical perspective, an important contribution of this study to the existing knowledge may be that it reveals various socio-cultural factors as constituting eventual sources of SA and thus it reinforces the concept that these factors may indeed influence students' SA.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

Approaches to the Study of Anxiety in Language Learning

There are three approaches towards language anxiety namely, trait, state and situation specific. Trait anxiety is regarded as a permanent trait of human personality and it is not restricted to any particular situation. MacIntyre (1999) defines trait anxiety as, "a feature of an individual's personality and therefore is both stable over time and applicable to a wide range of situations" (p. 28). It may be called an inbuilt anxiety, since it is a permanent characteristic of one's personality.

State anxiety is an unpleasant emotional condition or temporary state; in other words, anxiety experienced at a particular moment in time can be called state anxiety. MacIntyre (1999:28) defines it as a "moment-to-moment experience of anxiety; it is the transient emotional state of feeling nervous that can fluctuate over time and vary in intensity". Such a temporary anxious condition can be experienced in reaction to a specific event and it can increase or decrease in time. It can be argued that if the triggers of anxiety are removed (if students improve their language performance, for example) state anxiety levels may reduce. However, its frequent experience may turn into trait anxiety.

According to Gregersen&MacIntyre (2014)and MacIntyre (1999), the above two approaches assume that language anxiety is merely the transfer of other more general types of anxiety into foreign language learning. For instance, if a student experiences anxiety in certain situations, he/she would have a tendency to also feel nervous in the language classroom. Horwitz et al. (1986) argued that language learning contexts produce a unique type of anxiety which is different from its other types. This perspective provided a theoretical basis to future FLA studies (Tóth, 2010).According to Horwitz et al. (1986), therefore, FLA should not be simply regarded as "fears transferred to foreign language learning" but rather conceptualised as "a distinct complex of self-perceptions, beliefs, feelings, and behaviours related to classroom language learning arising from the uniqueness of the language learning process" (Horwitz et al., 1986:128). Thus, they suggested that FLA should be identified as a conceptually distinct variable, well characterized by the uniqueness of dynamic features of language learning and using it in the classroom. Researchers (such as Horwitz, 2010; Gregersen, 2012; Oteir& Al-Otaibi, 2019, Milan, 2019;Tóth, 2011) claim that the situation-specific anxiety approach provides a better understanding of language anxiety,

compared with state and trait anxieties, since it limits the assumptions and requires participants to attribute their language anxiety to a particular source. On the other hand, this approach may also be criticised. For example, the situation under investigation might be defined very broadly (e.g. taking a test), quite narrowly (such as communication apprehension), or extremely specifically (for example, stage fright).

Language Learning Anxiety Research
Since the 1970s researchers have been hypothesising that anxiety may have debilitative effects on second/foreign language learning and performance (Horwitz, 2017). However, early language anxiety studies provided "mixed and confusing results" (Naudhani at al., 2018), with some studies indicating a negative relationship between FLAand achievement (Clément et al., 1977, 1980), whereas otherssuggested no relationship or a positive relationship (Chastain,1975; Kleinmann, 1977). These inconsistencies between results may be attributed to the lack of a valid and reliable measure specific to language learning and a wide variety of anxiety types.

In the 1980s anxiety was acknowledged as an independent affective factor influencing the language learning process (Milan, 2019; Marwan, 2016). For example, MacIntyre& Gardner (1994) theorised that anxiety interferes with learning at each of the three stages of foreign language acquisition proposed by Tobias (1986): input, processing and output. At the input stage it may cause attention deficit and poor processing of information. At the processing stage it can interfere with the organisation of information, and at the final output stage it may interfere with the retrieval of previously learned information. In other words, anxiety may affect language learning when students are introduced to new material, when they are storing it, and when they attempt to speak in the target language by using the learned material. However, the final stage might be more anxiety-provoking, where students have to show their competence.

Subsequently, numerous researchers have contributed to and expanded FLA research (for example, Young, 1990; Koch & Terrell, 1991; Saito &Samimy, 1996; Onwuegbuzie et al., 1999; Sparks et al., 2000; 2007; Malik at al., 2020; Naudhani at al., 2018; Oteir& Al-Otaibi, 2019). More recently, studies have shifted their focus from establishing a relationship between anxiety and language achievement to examining anxiety in relation to various other factors such as: learner characteristics (Tóth, 2010); tests (Huang & Hung, 2013); gender (Mersi, 2012); students' beliefs about language learning (Wang, 2005) and motivation (Lim, 2004). Other studies have focused on examining language-skill-specific anxiety. Despite the evidence which suggests that FLA impairs language learning, there is still a lack of agreement over whether language anxiety is indeed the cause (Horwitz, 2010), or whether it is a consequence of poor language learning (Sparks &Ganschow, 2007).

Numerous studies report that much of the anxiety expressed by language students is associated with speaking the foreign language (Marwan, 2016; Horwitz et al., 1986; Lucas et al., 2011; Liu & Jackson, 2008; Toubot&Seng, 2018). For example, Horwitz& Young (1991:29) state that "difficulty in speaking in class is probably the most frequently cited concern of the anxious foreign language students seeking help". Similarly, MacIntyre (1999:33) contends that students regard speaking in class as "the single most important source of language anxiety". Tsiplakides&Keramida (2009) conducted a classroom-based case study in order to investigate the SA of 15 students in a lower secondary school in Greece, as well as to offer some solutions to teachers to reduce their students' SA. The researchers found that speaking in class was potentially a stressful situation for many students. The three main contributors to SA included FNE, fear of making mistakes (FMM), and perceptions of low ability. In their mixed-methods study of Chinese university-level students to examine how speaking anxiety (SA) interacts with personal and instructional factors and influences students' achievement, Yan &Horwitz (2008) found that personal factors strongly affected students' anxiety. Moreover, they suggested that students' immediate socio-cultural contexts may also produce SA for them and they highlighted two relevant socio-cultural factors: students' regional differences and parental influence. Other contributors to anxiety included aspects such as language aptitude, gender, class arrangements, and teacher characteristics. It is noteworthy that Yan &Horwitz's (2008) study highlighted only two socio-cultural factors, students' regional differences and parental influence, as anxiety-provoking factors. The current study, however, reported a number of socio-cultural factors that could contribute to student SA.

Possible Sources of SA
A review of the literature suggests that sources of anxiety range from personal (for example, self-confidence) to procedural (for example, classroom activities).

<u>Communication Apprehension</u>
Communication apprehension (CA) generally refers to a type of anxiety experienced before or during interaction with other people. CA is one of the primary sources of SA (Horwitz, 2010; Kim, 2009; Trang et

4201| **Abdus Samad**   Pakistani EFL University Students' Perceptions of How Language Anxiety Interacts with
Socio-Cultural Factors to Affect their English Learning and Speaking:
A Qualitative Analysis

al., 2013; Sadighi&Dastpak, 2017; Toubot&Seng, 2018). It may be experienced due to many factors, for instance when students cannot speak effectively because of poor speaking skills (Tóth, 2011) and when they perceive themselves as unable to communicate in the foreign language (Arnold, 2007). It could be argued that if students doubt their ability to communicate successfully in the class this may escalate their SA, as well as discourage them from communication. According to Young (1990), CA increases when students have to perform in front of the whole class. According to Horwitz et al. (1986) the higher status of the teacher may also contribute to students' CA.

Fear of Negative Evaluation

Fear of negative evaluation (FNE) is defined as an "apprehension about others' evaluations, avoidance of evaluative situations, and the expectation that others would evaluate oneself negatively" (Horwitz et al., 1986:128). FNE is also considered to be one of the major contributors to students' SA (Horwitz, 2013; Alghothani, 2010; Naudhani at al., 2018; Oteir& Al-Otaibi, 2019). Price (1991) conducted interviews with highly anxious students and found that several students preferred to sit silently in the class due to the fear "of being laughed at by others, of making a fool of themselves in public" (p.105). It means they might avoid participating in oral tasks which would improve their speaking. Likewise, Tsiplakides&Keramida (2009) conclude that the majority of their subjects experienced SA due to the fear that their peers and the teacher would judge them negatively and make fun of them.

Competitiveness

Competitiveness has been frequently reported as a factor contributing to students' SA (Yan &Horwitz, 2008; Tóth, 2011; Cheng, 2005; Milan, 2019). Tsiplakides&Keramida's (2009) one of their respondents states, "You listened to them [fellow students], didn't you? They speak English as if it's Greek. They're so much better than me. It's better if I just listen and not speak" (p.41). However, it is not necessary that the object of comparison must always be peers but rather the learners themselves, when they set high standards for their performance (Gregersen, 2005).

Learner Beliefs about Language Learning

Students' unrealistic beliefs and expectations about language learning and speaking have been reported as sources of SA (Wang, 2005; Ferdous, 2012; Onwuegbuzie et al., 1999; Dewaele, &Thirtle, 2009; Horwitz, 2017; Malik et al., 2020). For example, students in Horwitz's (1988) study expressed great concern over the accuracy of their utterances; believed that two years are sufficient to achieve native-like fluency; and believed that not everyone is capable of learning a foreign language. In the same vein, Wang (2005) adds some other learner beliefs, such as that memorising vocabulary and grammar are necessary to learn a foreign language. Moreover, some students may hold a belief that learning a new language is a very difficult task while others may perceive this process as very easy.

Teacher-Student Interaction

Many researchers associate SA with teacher-student interactions (e.g. Mersi, 2012; Ewald, 2007; Tóth, 2011; Piniel&Csizér, 2015; Sadighi&Dastpak, 2017; Toubot&Seng, 2018). Classroom procedures may be viewed differently by teachers and students (Horwitz, 1989), and any incompatibility between teachers' teaching styles and learners' learning styles may trigger anxiety for some students (Oxford, 1999). It implies that understanding the interaction between students' and teachers' views about the classroom may explain students' anxiety. Teacher-student interactions include anxieties such as harsh error correction, students' fear of being corrected publicly, students' concern over how their mistakes would be evaluated, and the type of teacher (Milan, 2019; Malik et al., 2020). Moreover, there is the possibility of mismatches between instructional practices and students' learning preferences; if the class is not taught the way students expected, they may feel tense and disappointed.

Classroom Procedures

Various classroom activities and teaching methods, particularly those that require students to speak in front of the class, seem to affect the levels of learner SA. Young (1990) listed the following SA-provoking classroom activities: spontaneous role play in front of the class; speaking in front of the class; and oral presentations and skits in front of the class.Similarly,Palacios (1998, cited in Lim, 2004) adds fear of being put on the spot, the pace of the class, and demands of oral production as other SA-provoking classroom activities.

Language Testing

Several studies report that tests in class incur anxiety (for instance, Marwan, 2016; Milan, 2019; Al-Sibai, 2005; Huang & Hung, 2013; Lucas et al., 2011; Oteir& Al-Otaibi, 2019). This occurs particularly when tests are unfamiliar, unclear, highly evaluative, and do not match the material taught in the class (Young, 1991; Daly, 1991). It suggests that the more confusing and novel the tests are, the more anxiety they produce.

4202| **Abdus Samad**   Pakistani EFL University Students' Perceptions of How Language Anxiety Interacts with
Socio-Cultural Factors to Affect their English Learning and Speaking:
A Qualitative Analysis

Research Methods

The majority of empirical studies have examined language anxiety quantitatively, using correlational methods of analysis (Horwitz, 2017). According to Yan &Horwitz (2008), previous studies' reliance on questionnaires could not explain the role of anxiety in language learning in depth. Thus they suggested that suggested to "interview learners about their feelings about language learning, an approach seldom used previously" (ibid:153). The methodology of this research is exploratory in nature. The study used in-depth semi-structured interviews as a data collection tool.

Research Sitesand Sample

The data were collected from five university departments, each in a different public sector university in Pakistan. The sample for interviews comprised 20 postgraduate non-English major Pakistani male and female students, four from each university. The selection criteria for interviewees were that those who were available, and were willing to be interviewed.

Data Collection Procedures

The interview technique was used in this study since it allows the researcher to gain information about unobservable factors such as beliefs, feelings, values, and prejudices (Wellington, 2000) an aspect that is particularly relevant since the study focuses on students' perceptions on SA. In the current research semi-structured interviews were used in order to dig deep into the participants' minds and moreover, they may express themselves freely and according to their priorities without the researcher's interference. A number of in-depth and open-ended main questions were asked keeping in view the aims of the study. Some of the main questions had some alternative forms or potential probe. Before conducting the interviews, a trial run, or pilot, was conducted, as recommended by Dörnyei (2007). The researcher contacted the students and informed them of the objectives and usefulness of the interview and assured that all information would be kept strictly anonymous and confidential throughout. In addition, they were clearly informed that their participation in interviews was totally voluntary. Many students not only showed their willingness to be interviewed but also seemed excited and they were grateful that for the first time someone was asking for their views. A high quality digital voice-recorder was used to record all the interviews for accuracy and transcription purposes. Questions were asked in a simple and clear way, so that the participants could easily understand and answer accurately. Each interview session lasted approximately 35-45 minutes.

Data Analysis Procedures

There is no single absolutely correct or best method of carrying out qualitative data analysis; rather there are various approaches and strategies to conduct it in a systematic and insightful way (Creswell, 1994). Analysis of interviews was guided by the procedures recommended by Miles &Huberman (1994): data reduction, data display and conclusion drawing. The qualitative data were analysed through exploratory content analysis.

Data Analysis and Research Findings

Analysis of data revealed seven socio-cultural factors that may be responsible for students' SA.

Students' Geographic Background

Some students from rural backgrounds reported in their interviews that they did not have the opportunity to seek better English training and speaking skills; therefore, they were worried about their success in their current class.

For example, Tahir explained:

I am from a small village and you know that our villages are deprived of good schools and colleges. Trust me, our teacher's English was very poor … students from cities are lucky. They have studied at Beaconhouse and City Schools [English institutions of high repute]; therefore, their oral communication is strong. I wish I had studied at such institutions…. I am really much upset.

Similarly, Hussain, who was also from a village, clearly believed that his rural background was responsible for not providing him with good training and a strong foundation in English; he could not therefore perform well in oral activities in the university class and, in turn, experienced frustration and SA:

When I came to this big city, I found that you can attend private spoken English courses about which I never heard in my village. Sometimes, I regret I was born in a village. I am worried about my speaking performance in my university class … the problem is I did not have the chance to go to good institutions.

Students' Pre-University English Education

In relation to the students' pre-university English education, the data revealed that the students who had studied English previously at Urdu-medium institutions believed that their *"foundation of English is weak"*; and their speaking skills are particularly poor. Consequently, they cannot perform well in various oral tasks in their university class and, in turn, experience frustration and SA.

For example, Hussain, who had studied English in Urdu-medium institutions, reported as follows:

… Our teacher's medium of instruction was Urdu when teaching us English and he never involved us in oral activities in the class. Therefore, my spoken English is poor from the beginning. Here in the university class, I have to take part in many oral tasks … he [the teacher] expects me to speak English fluently, but I have not been taught … is it possible for me to speak in English.

Likewise, Noman faced problems in speaking and he regretted for studying English at Urdu-medium institutions, he said in his interview:

I think I have started learning English from my university class as previously I was not taught well. Now I try but I can't do well … it is like crying over spilled milk. I wish I had studied English in English-medium institutions.

The Role of Students' Parents

The data revealed that students' parents can also affect their English acquisition. According to some students, their previous English education, particularly speaking proficiency, was poor because their parents were unaware of the usefulness of English for their future; therefore they did not send them to English-medium institutions. Moreover, they did not motivate them to pay attention to English. This was why, according to the students, they were facing difficulties in the oral aspects of English in their current class.

For example, the following comment from Noman's interview explains this phenomenon and moreover, it indicates that the parents' education can also affect their children's academic achievement:

My father was uneducated and he was completely unaware of the importance of English for his son; thus, he never cared about my English. He didn't send me to the English-medium school. I am sure my spoken English would have been better if my father had sent me to prestigious English institutions.

Another comment from Adnan's interview indicates that parents' socio-economic condition can also affect students' language learning and speaking skills. The parents may not be rich enough to send their children to expensive English institutions in their childhood; therefore, they may not be as competent in English. In consequence, it may be hard for them to do well in speaking activities at university. Adnan added:

In fact, my father did not have money to buy food for the family, how could he send me to expensive institutions?

It is interesting that on the other hand, parents' over-involvement in their offspring's English learning and their expectations of them can also make students anxious. The following excerpt from Ali's interview seems to indicate that parents' concern can make students feel more responsible and if they are not performing well, they may feel SA:

My parents keep reminding me the importance of English. I feel very worried as I feel a huge responsibility on my shoulders … the problem is I am not good at speaking English.

Social and Cultural Trends

A number of issues related to social and cultural trends were revealed by the data. The data from this study revealed that socio-cultural differences between rural and urban students can influence some rural students' willingness to participate in oral activities and induce SA for them. Tahir, who was from a village, stated in his interview:

Students from cities do not mix with us [village students]. We explain things according to our own culture and they laugh … they say we are Paindoo [meaning stupid villagers] and they make fun of our clothes, our speaking, and our accent … their presence in the class makes me depressed and tense.

He further added:

They [students from cities] are dominant in the class and we [students from villages] mostly sit silently in the class.

Second, speaking in front of socially and economically superior students could also be a difficult task for some students. Ali said:

…if students, who are socially and economically superior to me, are members of my group presentation, I don't feel comfortable and confident speaking in front of them … I even can't talk to them.

Thirdly, a high status of teachers in Pakistani society could also be a source of SA for some students. Pica's (1987) study on classroom interaction indicated that some students may feel tense in class due to the higher status of the teacher. As Kashif explained in his interview:

The teacher is like our father … I have been taught to bow my head in front of him. He is like a big big tree and we [students] are like small trees under him.

Additionally, findings of the current study indicated that the culture of rote learning can also make some students uncomfortable in various oral activities. Moreover, students can also feel nervous when they forget their memorised materials. This result may be attributed to the prevalent teaching style because students are encouraged to memorise the material needed to pass.
Shabnam stated in her interview:

Sometime, I forget the memorised material … I feel I never memorised. If I forget a word I forget everything and then I lose confidence and feel embarrassed.

Fifth, according to the students, some teachers may be biased and favour certain students and ignore others or give them a lower mark. This behaviour on the part of the teacher can make some students worried and uneasy. For example, Huma said in her interview:

They [teachers] have their choices. They have good relations with some students because they like them but they ignore other students because they do not like them.

Similarly, Ali said in his interview, *"How would you feel if the teacher ignores you and pays attention to other students?"*
Finally, the interview data analysis suggested that students may feel anxiety when speaking due to the fear, stress, and pressure that their views, opinions, and arguments might not be socially unacceptable or against religion (Islam). The following comment by Kashif shows how he was dealt with and how he developed SA when he talked about this topic in his class:

… Once I selected the topic 'advantages of a married life' to speak about in class. In the course of my talk, I talked about romantic relations between a husband and wife and some female students left the class. Then, my teacher became angry and she insulted me in front of all students for selecting such an inappropriate topic. Since then, I have developed a fear that I might say something bad.

It can be very dangerous in Pakistan to question religion or say anything against it. Adnan was afraid of saying anything against religion or other students' religious factions:

Whenever I make an oral presentation or discuss a topic, I have a fear in my mind that my ideas should be against religion or other students' religious sects because if so, I will get into trouble.

Cultural Alienation
Two students' comments in their interviews seemed to indicate that they regarded English as a language

4205| **Abdus Samad**   Pakistani EFL University Students' Perceptions of How Language Anxiety Interacts with
Socio-Cultural Factors to Affect their English Learning and Speaking:
A Qualitative Analysis

of usurpers and moreover, a threat to their self-identity, culture, and languages. This attitude could induce SA for some students. Adil stated:

I really hate learning and speaking English. English people dominated our country and their language is still dominating our national and regional languages. As you know that many people feel pride in speaking English and they think that Urdu is the language of common people. I think English is taking us away from our religion and culture.
A similar concern was voiced by Shaheen:

... However, it is painful that many people prefer English to Urdu ... English is dominant in every field. Why we don't use Urdu ... it means we are ignoring ourselves, our culture and values ... why do we follow the west blindly? This is not good and everyone should be concerned about this.

Competitiveness
The data from the current study also suggested that students may become worried and stressful when they compare their speaking proficiency with that of their peers and find that their spoken English is poorer. As Javed observed:

Some students in my class speak fluently. They do much better in oral tasks than I do and they rarely make mistakes. I feel stressed and I ask myself, 'why are they better than me ... why I can't perform as well as they do?'

Adnan said, *"The realisation that they are much better than me makes me sad".* On the other hand, one students comment indicated that more capable and better students in the class could be a source of motivation and inspiration for some students.

Mixed-Gender Classrooms
The data from this study suggested that mixed-gender classrooms can create stress for some students. For example, the following comment by Tahir indicates that the presence of female students in class could make some male students uncomfortable:

I am not used to studying with girls. I feel tense and become very self-conscious due to their presence in the class.

Hussain agreed:

I feel uneasy due to our female classmates ... when I make mistakes I feel much ashamed of myself due to the presence of girls in our class.

Similarly, the data indicated that female students could also feel stressed due to the presence of male students in the class. For example, Shabnam felt uncomfortable and shy due to boys in the class:

I am studying with boys for the first time ... it is hard for me to speak or ask questions due to them. I think I would feel more active and confident if boys were not listening to me.

IV.   DISCUSSION OF THE RESEARCH FINDINGS

Students' Geographic Background
In the Pakistani context, with regard to students' geographic backgrounds, students can be broadly divided into two types: students from rural areas and students from urban areas. There is evidence in the data that students' place of origin may influence their English language and speaking ability. This finding is consistent with Yan &Horwitz's (2008) study that suggests that regional differences in the English language education system in China affect students' speaking proficiency and can promote students to worry about their performance in their university class. The data from my study indicated that rural students' anxiety about speaking (SA) may stem from two factors. Firstly, some students from the countryside explained that they were facing difficulties in their current university class precisely because they came from the countryside and previously had not had enough opportunities to acquire a good

4206| **Abdus Samad**   Pakistani EFL University Students' Perceptions of How Language Anxiety Interacts with
                             Socio-Cultural Factors to Affect their English Learning and Speaking:
                             A Qualitative Analysis

English education. Secondly, they commented that they sometimes got upset when they discovered that their urban counterparts had studied English at better institutions and that the spoken English of some of their urban classmates was very good.

These findings can be explained against the backdrop of an unequal access to English in rural and urban areas of Pakistan. The towns of Pakistan provide better language learning conditions such as: dedicated language institutions, spoken English academies, language labs, qualified teachers, classroom facilities and course materials (Inayat, 2004; Latif, 2009). In contrast, rural areas are mostly poor in terms of learning facilitators (ibid). Taking into account the previous discussion and the data from this study, it could be argued that the government has failed to provide rural students with high-quality English language tuition and general education. Rural students, therefore, might experience SA due to poor spoken proficiency as well as the feeling that they are weak in English, which can provide enormous social and economic capital in Pakistan.

Students' Pre-University English Education

The data highlighted the educational divide in Pakistani society. There is evidence in the data that those students who had studied English previously at Urdu-medium schools may be at a disadvantage in their university English studies. The reason is that their speaking skills are considered poor; consequently they can often not do well in their current class and, as a result, they experience frustration and anxiety. In Pakistan Urdu-medium institutions are known for the poor quality of their English education. In contrast, English-medium institutions provide a better English language education. Moreover, the graduates of these institutions have better career prospects than their counterparts from Urdu-medium institutions (Rahman, 2004).

However at university level students from these both systems of education study together in the same class, with the same course contents, objectives, and examination system. Moreover, at this level the demands of English increase; namely that oral aspects are given significant attention, and expectations about performance are high. Some of the students in this study perhaps rightly believe that they lack proficiency in speaking, since their schooling has not been at English-medium schools. Therefore, they find themselves unable to perform well in various oral tasks in their university class and, as a consequence, they experience SA. Moreover, an insufficient and short experience of learning good English and speaking (Wilson, 2006; Milan, 2019) and the fear of not fulfilling the expectations of their families may also constitute reasons for students' SA. Some studies conducted in Pakistan also report that students with Urdu-medium backgrounds face difficulties when speaking English in their university class due to their poor educational background in general (Zafar, 2006).

This system with uneven educational opportunities has been criticised as 'unjust' and 'dividing the nation' (Rahman 2004). This divided system of education also reflects socio-economic disparities since families belonging to poor social classes in Pakistan cannot send their children to English-medium institutions because they are expensive. The ruling elite of Pakistan maintains hegemony in education due to its wealth. In fact, this same elite has a solid rationale and an important stake in reserving good English institutions for its members because doing so differentiates the so-called 'elite' from and gives them an edge over the so-called 'poor' of the country. This, in turn, may widen the gap between the 'haves' and 'have-nots'. The country is already polarised due to ideology, ethnicity, religious sects, and culture. Consequently there is an urgent need for the government to provide its people with a single system of education which could help bridge the gaps and promote national unity.

The Role of Students' Parents

The data highlighted that students' parents can play a significant role in students' language learning and speaking anxiety (SA). Yan &Horwitz (2008) also found that some university students blamed their parents for not realising the importance of English in their childhood. Bennett et al. (2002) found that parents' involvement in students' English learning helps to develop their language skills. Similarly, Latif's (2009) study in Pakistan concludes that the children of involved parents tend to be more confident, interested, and relaxed students than those whose parents are not involved.

In the Pakistani context, one reason, as revealed by the data from this study, ascribed to the parents' lack of concern about their children's English education could be attributed to parents' own lack of education. Illiterate parents might not have a positive or supportive approach towards their children's English-learning. On the other hand, studies report that having educated parents may also affect students' classroom performance. Shamim&Tribble's (2005) study in Pakistan found that EFL students with educated parents show higher academic achievement than that of their peers with uneducated parents.

However, the matter is not quite so simple, as some parents might be very much involved in their children's English learning. Mansoor (2003) and Shamim&Tribble (2005) report that some Pakistani parents are indeed extremely concerned about their children's English education; e. g. sending their

4207| **Abdus Samad**   Pakistani EFL University Students' Perceptions of How Language Anxiety Interacts with
Socio-Cultural Factors to Affect their English Learning and Speaking:
A Qualitative Analysis

children to English coaching academies or hiring private tutors for them. This finding may be justified in Pakistani society where some parents provide constant guidance to their children about their academic success. Moreover, as speaking English represents a gateway to economic benefits, Pakistani parents may advise their children to learn this language, not only for their own betterment, but also for the whole family, especially from the financial perspective.

The data from this study also suggested that students' parents' poor socio-economic situations may also affect students' language achievement and SA. It is an interesting finding because this factor seems to have not previously appeared in the literature as a source of anxiety. Some studies in Pakistan suggest that the economic status of students' parents may affect students' English achievement as they do not have opportunities to go to good institutions (e.g. Parveen, 2007; Shamim, 2011).

Social and Cultural Trends

The data in this study highlighted various social and cultural trends which could cause speaking anxiety (SA) for some students. Firstly, there is evidence in the data that students from rural areas of Pakistan may experience SA due to some of their urban counterparts making fun of their speaking and culture. Pakistan is a land of diverse languages, races and cultures (Grimes 2000; Rahman, 2004). Islam (2013) states that cultural, linguistic, socio-economic and geographical differences exist between urban and rural areas of Pakistan.Moreover, there are socio-cultural differences between both areas in terms of dress code, manners, and traditions. Students from both areas enter the university with their 'cultural baggage'. Since the class system is still strong in Pakistan (Inayat, 2004), some urban students may regard themselves as socially superior, better-educated and more civilised than their peers from rural backgrounds. Thus, the former may not mix with the latter and the urban students may even make fun of their classmates from rural areas.

Another anxiety-provoking socio-cultural trend appears to be teacher bias and favouritism. There could be many explanations for it in the Pakistani context. For example, some teachers may take revenge on those students who say anything against them. This sometimes could result in a harsh reprisal; e.g. failing students' papers. There have been allegations made in the Pakistani newspapers and on national TV that some teachers show the question papers to their favourite students prior to the examination. Such behaviour on the part of teachers could be frustrating for students who do not benefit from such perks.

Finally, there is evidence in the data that students have a fear when speaking, that their opinions might be in conflict with their religion. This finding does not seem surprising in a society such as Pakistan, which lacks freedom of expression and tolerance. There are certain topics, such as sex and religion, which are unacceptable subjects for discussion in Pakistani society. Religion, particularly, is a serious and sensitive issue in Pakistan and criticising it can be extremely harmful. Those people who question religion (Islam) or say anything against Islam are called 'atheists' by religious leaders and religious leaders issue Islamic rulings against them, which may lead to their extrajudicial killing. These examples illustrate how harmful it might be to say anything against Islam in Pakistan.

Cultural Alienation

Although the current study and several other Pakistani studies (e.g. Shamim, 2011; Rahman, 2007) report that Pakistani EFL students tend to be highly-motivated, the reality does not appear to be as simple and one-sided. The present study and various Pakistani studies highlight that some Pakistani students may regard English as a threat to their culture, religion, and identity. It is reported that some factions in Pakistani society, particularly Islamic religious leaders, have negative feelings towards the English language. These people sometimes believe that English is a tool to replace Pakistani culture and civilisation with western culture and traditions (Hussain, 2004; Inayat, 2004).

Many studies in the field of ELT and education report that foreign language-learning may challenge one's identity and views of world (e.g. Clément, 1980; Guiora et al.1972). Pakistani society is divided between liberals and fundamentalists and extremists. The extremist clerics give emotional sermons about heaven and hell. They are mostly blindly-followed and believed in Pakistan. It is my personal experience that some Pakistani religious scholars are against western education. This might have influenced young Pakistanis' attitudes towards the English language. The majority of students do not have negative attitudes about English; however, the data suggests that there may be some students who may harbour such thoughts.The mixed feelings described: on the one hand a social and economic need to learn and speak English well and on the other, learning the language with suspicion, may create inner turmoil for some students. It is suggested that the English language might not be equated with colonial language but could be considered as an international language which is an important channel to establish and maintain connections in this global world.

Competitiveness

In light of these study findings, it appears that Pakistani EFL classrooms tend to encourage a competitive

culture rather than a culture of cooperative learning. This result is consistent with Yan &Horwitz (2008) who concluded that competitiveness directly affected their participants' SA levels. Similarly, Kitano's (2001) research on Japanese learners reports that students' SA levels increased "when they perceive their own speaking ability as poorer than that of their peers" (p. 558). In contrast, the data collected during the current study also suggested that competitiveness can play a facilitative role. For example, it may foster a motivation in some students to increase their efforts to do better or be as good as their peers. I think a certain level of pressure may motivate students but too much of it may reduce and dampen their enthusiasm and interest.

Mixed-Gender Classrooms

The findings of this study highlighted that the presence of the opposite sex in Pakistani EFL classrooms can create speaking anxiety (SA) for some students. It is my personal experience as an EFL university teacher that at times some female students, who mostly preferred to sit silently in class, used to come to my office after the session to ask questions. Even, some acknowledged that they could not ask questions or answer to various questions as they felt shy due to male students in class.

One suggestion could be that activities may be structured to involve both genders in order to eliminate students' fear and shyness and encourage collaboration and openness in all tasks. Men and women can work together in different fields of life for the betterment of the country. Therefore, it is also important to train these university students to work together at this level, so that in their future they may work together for the progress of the country. This anxiety about the opposite sex may stem principally from students' lack of exposure to the opposite sex in Pakistani academic institutions and society. The culture of co-education is not common in most of the schools and colleges in Pakistan. Many students may experience it for the first time at university. **Implications**

There appears to be a shortage of studies examining anxiety in relation to students' immediate socio-cultural contexts. This study contributes to the existing knowledge by reinforcing the concept that socio-cultural factors associated with language learning may affect students' anxiety levels. Accordingly, it suggests that language anxiety can be investigated beyond the cognitive and psychological dimensions.

The principal message of this research for Pakistani EFL teachers is that speaking anxiety (SA) does indeed exist in classrooms and it can have a detrimental effect on students' speaking performance. Consequently, the first and most important step is that teachers should be aware of SA, acknowledge its presence in English classrooms and accept learners' anxious reactions as "legitimate" (Onwuegbuzie et al., 1999:32). In addition, teachers can also reduce their students' SA and save them from academic and emotional stress through effective communication. Moreover, new provisions such as English Language Support Units, online teacher consultation resources, Student Counselling Centre, and mentors could all be introduced in Pakistani universities. Also, it is recommended that policy-makers address the issue of teacher power and authority in Pakistani EFL classrooms.

The diverse system of education in Pakistan may widen the divide between the 'haves' and the 'have-nots' in this country. As such, it is recommended that the government works to replace the current system of education with one homogeneous system. Alternatively, the government and educational policy-makers should attempt, at least, to reduce this educational divide, specifically in English language education, in the country as a whole.

Another implication for the policy-makers and designers of ELT materials is to consider including the events and features of the local culture in ELT courses. This action may counter students' potential feelings of cultural alienation. Moreover, due to the changing role of English as an international language, various countries are developing their own variety of English such as Singlish (Singaporean English). In Pakistan many Urdu words; for example, *'ustaad'* meaning teacher, *'melas'* meaning festival and *'roti'* meaning bread, are currently used when speaking English (Bilal et al., 2012). Therefore, introducing a local variety of English could be helpful in making the English learning more effective and enjoyable for Pakistani EFL learners (e.g. Bilal et al., 2011; Mahboob, 2009).

V. SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

In the first instance, given the shortage of research in the field of language anxiety in Pakistan, it could be productive to replicate this study with a larger number of participants in various universities in multiple regions of Pakistan. Nextly, as anxiety represents both a multidimensional and complex phenomenon; it would be worthwhile carrying out a longitudinal study to find a better and deeper understanding of this topic. Similarly, investigating the relationship between gender and SA could also give insights about how gender differences can affect SA.

VI. CONCLUSION

The aim of this study was to investigate the perceptions of Pakistaninon-major EFL university students about SA. The study reveals that various socio-cultural factors may contribute to anxiety and that it is a pervasive phenomenon in language classroom. Several students in this study considered it a factor which may seriously influence their speaking performance in class. Therefore, it needs targeted attention and an active response from English teachers in order to address it.

REFERENCES

1. Ahmad, S., &Rao, C. (2013).Applying communicative approach in teaching English as a foreign language: A case study of Pakistan.*PortaLinguarum,* 187-203.
2. Alghothani, D. (2010). *Foreign language anxiety in an intermediate Arabic reading course: A comparison of heritage and foreign language learners.*Unpublished doctoral dissertation, The Ohio State University.
3. Al-Sibai, D. M. (2005).*L2 anxiety of Saudi female university students enrolled in speaking courses.* Retrieved 25 July 2009, from http://docs.ksu.edu.sa/PDF/Articles47/Article470521.pdf
4. Arnold, J.,& Brown, H. D. (1999).A map of the terrain.In J. Arnold (Ed.), *Affect in Language Learning* (pp.1-24).Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
5. Arnold, N. (2007). Reducing foreign language apprehension with computer mediated communication: A preliminary study. *System, 35(4)*, 469-486.
6. Bennett, K. K., Weigel, D. J., & Martin, S. S. (2002). Children's acquisition of early literacy skills: Examining family contributions. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 17,* 295-317.
7. Bilal, A., Warraich, A., Fatima, N., Tiwana, S., &Bhatti, R. (2012).Urdu loan-words in Pakistani English.*Global Journal of Human Social Science Linguistics & Education, 12(9).*
8. Chastain, K. (1975). Affective and ability factors in second language acquisition.*Language Learning, 25,* 153-161.
9. Cheng, C. J. (2005). *The relationship of foreign language anxiety of oral performance achievement, teacher characteristics and in-class activities.*Unpublished MA dissertation, Ming Chun University, Taipei City.
10. Clément, R., Gardner, R. C., &Smythe, P. C. (1977). Motivational variables in second language acquisition: A study of Francophones learning English. *Canadian Journal of Behavioral Science, 9(2),* 123-133.
11. Clément, R., Gardner, R. C., &Smythe, P. C. (1980).Social and individual factors in second language acquisition.*Canadian Journal of Behavioural Science, 12,* 293-302.
12. Clément, R., Gardner, R. C., &Smythe, P. C. (1980).Social and individual factors in second language acquisition.*Canadian Journal of Behavioural Science, 12,* 293-302.
13. Creswell, J. W. (1994). *Research Design: Qualitative & quantitative approach.* London: Sage Publications Ltd.
14. Daly, J. (1991). Understanding communication apprehension: An introduction for language educators. In E. K. Honwitz& D. J. Young (Eds.), *Language Anxiety:From theory and research to classroom implications* (pp. 3-13). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
15. Dewaele, J. M., &Thirtle, H. (2009). Why do some young learners drop foreign languages? A focus on learner-internal variables.*International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism, 12(6),* 635-649.
16. Dörnyei, Z. (2007). *Research Methods in Applied Linguistics.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.
17. Ewald, J. D. (2007). Foreign language learning anxiety in upper-level classes: Involving students as researchers. *Foreign Language Annals, 40,* 122-142.
18. Ferdous, F. (2012).A case study of first-year-non-English undergraduate students' English learning anxiety in Bangladesh.*Journal of Education and Practice, 3(9),* 1-12.
19. Gardner, R. C. (1991). Foreword. In E. K. Horwitz& D. J. Young (Eds.), *Language anxiety: From theory and research to classroom implications* (pp.129-140). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
20. Ghani, M. (2003).The status and position of English language in Pakistan.*Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities, 1(1).*
21. Gregersen, T. S. (2005). Nonverbal cues: Clues to the detection of foreign language anxiety. *Foreign Language Annals, 38(3),* 388-400.
22. Gregersen, T. S., &MacIntyre, P. D. (2014).*Capitalizing on Language Learners' Individuality: From Premise to Practice.* Bristol, England: Multilingual Matters, Pp. xxvii-259.

23. Grimes, B. F. (Ed.) (2000).Pakistan. In*Ethnologue: Languages of the world* (14th ed. pp, 588-598.) Dallas, Texas; Summer Institute of Linguistics.

24. Guiora, A. (1972). Construct validity and transpositional research toward an empirical study of psychoanalytic concepts. *Comprehensive Psychiatry, 23,* 139-50.

25. Horwitz, E. K. (1988). The beliefs about language learning of beginning university foreign language students.*The Modern Language Journal, 72(3)*, 283-294.

26. Horwitz, E. K. (1989). Recent research on second language learners: Beliefs and anxiety. *Texas Papers in Foreign Language Education, Special Edition, 2,* 283-294.

27. Horwitz, E. K. (2010). Foreign and second language anxiety.*Language Teaching, 43,* 154-167.

28. Horwitz, E. K. (2013). *Becoming a Language Teacher: A practical guide to second language learning and teaching* (2nded). Pearson.

29. Horwitz, E. K. (2017). On the misreading of Horwitz, Horwitz, and Cope (1986) and the need to balance anxiety research and the experiences of anxious language learners. In C. Gkonou, M. Daubney, & J. M. Dewaele (Eds.), New insights into language anxiety: Theory, research and educational implications (pp. 31–50). Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.

30. Horwitz, E. K., & Young, D. (1991).*Language Anxiety: From theory and research to classroom implications.* Englewood Cliffs, N.J: Prentice-Hall.

31. Horwitz, E. K., Horwitz, M., & Cope, J. (1986).Foreign language classroom anxiety.*The Modern Language Journal, 70(2),* 125-132.

32. Huang, H. T., & Hung, S. T. (2013).Comparing the effects of test anxiety on independent and integrated speaking test performance.*TESOL Quarterly, 47*(2), 244-269.

33. Hussain, S. (2004).*Effectiveness of teacher training in developing professional attitude of prospective secondary school teachers.*Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Arid Agriculture, Rawalpindi, Pakistan.

34. Inayat, N. (2004). *Parental involvement, attitudes and responsibilities in education: A case study of parents in Britain and Pakistan.*Unpublished doctoral dissertation, London South Bank University.

35. Islam, M. (2013).*L2 motivational self system and relational factors affecting the L2 motivation of Pakistani students in the public universities of central Punjab, Pakistan.*Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Univeristy of Leeds, UK.

36. Kim, S. Y. (2009). Questioning the stability of foreign language classroom anxiety and motivation across different classroom contexts.*Foreign Language Annals, 42(1),* 138-157.

37. Kitano, K. (2001). Anxiety in the college Japanese language.*The Modern Language Journal,85(4),* 549-566.

38. Kleinmann, H. (1977). Avoidance behavior in adult second language acquisition.*Language Learning*, *27*, 93-107.

39. Koch, A. S., & Terrell, T. D. (1991).Affective reactions of foreign language students to natural approach activities and teaching techniques. In E. K. Horwitz& D. J. Young (Eds.), *LanguageAnxiety: From theory and practice to classroom implications*(pp.108 -126). Upper Saddle River, N. J: Prentice Hall.

40. Latif, A. (2009). A critical analysis of school enrollment and literacy rates of girls and women in Pakistan. *Educational Studies, 45,* 424-439.

41. Lim, H. Y. (2004). *Effects of task values, attributions, andcultural constructs on foreign language use anxietyamong international teaching assistants.*Unpublished doctoral dissertation, The University of Texas at Austin.

42. Liu, M., & Huang, W. (2011).An exploration of foreign language anxiety and English motivation.*Education Research International,* 1-8.

43. Liu, M.,& Jackson, J. (2008).An exploration of Chinese EFL learners' unwillingness to communicate and foreign language anxiety.*The Modern Language Journal, 92(1),* 71-86.

44. Lo, j. (2017). Effects of Social Context on Foreign Language Anxiety among University English Learners in Hong Kong.*The European Conference on Language Learning 2017: Official Conference Proceedings.* Brighton, UK

45. Lucas, R., Miraflores, E., & Go, D. (2011).English language learning anxiety among foreign language learners in the Philippines.*Philippine ESL Journal*, *7*, 94-119.

46. MacIntyre, P. D. (1999). Language anxiety: A review of the research for language teachers. In D. J. Young (Ed.), *Affect in Foreign Language and Second Language Learning: Apractical guide to creating a low-anxiety classroom atmosphere*(pp. 24-45). Boston: McGraw-Hill.

47. MacIntyre, P. D., & Gardner, R. C. (1994).The subtle effects of language anxiety on cognitive processing in the second language.*Language Learning, 44*, 283-305.

48. Mahboob, A. (2009). English as an Islamic language: A case study of Pakistani English. *World Englishes, 28(2), 175-189.*

49. Malik, S., Qin, H., khan, S. M., & Ahmed, K. (2020). Quantitative Analysis of the Foreign Language Anxiety: Chinese and Pakistani Postgraduates in Focus. *Arab World English Journal, 11* (1) 315-330.

50. Mansoor, S. (2003). Language planning in higher education: Issues of access and equity. *The Lahore Journal of Economics, 8*, 17-42.

51. Marwan, A. (2016). Investigating students' foreign language anxiety.*Malaysian Journal of ELT Research, 3(1), 19.*

52. Mersi, F. (2012).The relationship between gender and Iranian EFL learners' foreign language classroom anxiety (FLCA).*International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences, 2(6),* 147-156.

53. Milan, M. (2019).English speaking anxiety: sources, coping mechanisms, and teacher management. *International Journal of Teaching, Education and Learning,* 3-2.

54. Miles, M., &Huberman, A. (1994).*Qualitative Data Analysis: An expanded sourcebook*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

55. Naudhani, M. Wu. Z. &Naudhani, S (2018). Exploring the factors of foreign language anxiety among Chinese undergraduate English majors and Non-English majors.*International Journal of English Linguistics, 8-5*

56. Onwuegbuzie, A. J., Bailey, P., & Daley, C. E. (1999). Factors associated with foreign language anxiety. *Applied Psycholinguistics*, *20(2),* 217-239.

57. Oteir, I. N., & Al-Otaibi, A. N. (2019). Foreign Language Anxiety: *A Systematic Review. Arab World English Journal, 10 (3) 309-317.*

58. Oxford, R. L. (1999). Anxiety and the language learner: New insights. In J. Arnold (Ed.), *Affect in Language Learning* (pp.58-67). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

59. Palacios, L. M. (1998). *Foreign language anxiety and classroom environment: A study of Spanish university students.*Unpublished doctoral dissertation, The University of Texas, Austin.

60. Parveen, A. (2007). *Effect of home environment on personality and academic achievement of students of grade 12 in Rawalpindi division.*Unpublished doctoral dissertation, National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad, Pakistan.

61. Pica, T. (1987).Second language acquisition, social interaction, and the classroom.*Applied Linguistics, 8(1),* 3-21.

62. Piniel, K., &Csizér, K. (2015).Changes in motivation, anxiety, and self-efficacy during the course of an academic writing seminar. In Z. Dörnyei, P. D. MacIntyre& A. Henry (Eds.), *Motivational Dynamics in Language Learning* (pp.164-191). Multilingual Matters.

63. Price, M. L. (1991). The subjective experience of foreign language anxiety: Interviews with highly anxious students. In E. K. Horwitz& D. J. Young (Eds.), *Language Anxiety: From theory and research to classroom implications*(pp. 101-108). Englewood Cliffs, N.J: Prentice Hall.

64. Rahman, T. (2004).*Denizens of Alien Worlds: A study of education, inequality and polarization in Pakistan.* Oxford, London: Oxford University Press.

65. Rahman, T. (2007).*Denizens of Alien Worlds: A survey of the education system of Pakistan.* Retrieved 15 April 2010, from www.uoit.ca/sas/Articles/DAW.pdf on 07-07-2007

66. Sadighi, F., &Dastpak, M. (2017).The sources of foreign language speaking anxiety of Iranian English language learners. International Journal of Education and Literacy Studies, 5(4), 111-115.

67. Saito, Y.,&Samimy, K. K. (1996). Foreign language anxiety and language performance: A study of learner anxiety in beginning, intermediate, and advanced-level college students of Japanese. *Foreign Language Annals, 29(2),* 239-252.

68. Shahbaz, M. (2012).*A study of motivational factors for English language learning in Pakistan: A socio-contextual perspective.*Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Northeast Normal University Changchun Jilin P.R. China.

69. Shamim, F. (2011). English as the language for development in Pakistan: Issues, challenges and possible solutions. In H.Coleman (Ed.), *Dreams and Realities: Developing Countries and the English Language.*London: British Council.

70. Shamim, F., &Tribble, C. (2005).*Current provisions for English language teaching in higher education in Pakistan*.Report submitted to National Committee on English Higher Education Commission, Islamabad.

71. Sparks, R, L., &Ganschow, L. (2007). Is the Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS) measuring anxiety or language skills? *Foreign Language Annals, 40,* 260–287.

72. Sparks, R. L., Ganschow, L., &Javorsky, J. (2000).Deja vu all over again.A response to Saito, Horwitz,

and Garza.*The Modern Language Journal*, *84(2)*, 251-255.

73. Tobias, S. (1986). Anxiety and cognitive processing of instruction.In R. Schwarzer (Ed.),*Self-related Cognition in Anxiety and Motivation* (pp. 35-54). Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.

74. Tóth, Zs. (2010). *Foreign Language Anxiety and the Advanced Language Learner: A study of Hungarian students of English as a foreign language*. England: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

75. Tóth, Zs. (2011). Foreign language anxiety and advanced EFL learners: An interview study. *WoPaLP, 5,* 39-57.

76. Toubot, A. M., &Seng, G. H. (2018).Examining Levels and Factors of Speaking Anxiety among EFL Libyan English Undergraduate Students. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature*, *7*(5), 47–56.

77. Trang, T. T. T., Baldauf, R. B. J., &Moni, K. (2013). Foreign language anxiety: Understanding its status and insiders' awareness and attitudes. *TESOL Quarterly, 47*(2), 216-243.

78. Tsiplakides, I., &Keramida, A. (2009). Helping students overcome foreign language speaking anxiety in the English classroom: Theoretical issues and practical recommendations. *International Education Studies, 2(4),* 39-44.

79. Wang, N. (2005). *Beliefs about language learning and foreign language anxiety: A study of university students learning English as a foreign language in Mainland China.*Unpublished MA dissertation, University of Victoria, Saanich, British Colombia.

80. Wellington, J. (2000). *Educational Research: Contemporary issues and practical approaches.* London: Continuum.

81. Wilson, T. J. S. (2006). *Anxiety in learning English as a foreign language: Its association with student variables, with overall proficiency, and with performance on an oral test.*Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Granada.

82. Yan, J. X., &Horwitz, E. K. (2008). Learners' perceptions of how anxiety interacts with personal and instructional factors to influence their achievement in English: A qualitative analysis of EFL learners in China. *Language Learning, 58(1*), 151–183.

83. Young, D. J. (1990).An investigation of students' perspectives on anxiety and speaking.*Foreign Language Annals, 23(6),* 539-553.

84. Young, D. J. (1991). Creating a low-anxiety classroom environment: What does language anxiety research suggest? *The Modern Language Journal, 75(4),* 426-439.

85. Zafar, A. (2006). Traditional and modern approaches in ESL teaching at different levels in Pakistan.*International Journal of Learning, 13(7),* 61-66.