



# A Comparative Study of Students' Academic Achievement through Urdu and English Language as Medium of Instruction at Secondary Schools

Shakeel Gill, PhD Scholar, Department of Education, University of Lahore

Dr. Muhammad Hameed Nawaz, Professor, Department of Education, University of Lahore

**Abstract**-The aim of the present study was to compare students' academic achievement through Urdu and English language as a medium of instruction at secondary school level. It was descriptive research base on survey design. Data was collected from 1416 students of 10<sup>th</sup> class who were selected by applying a simple random sampling technique via a self-developed questionnaire. The collected data was arranged and coded. The coded data was entered into computer and analyzed by applying inferential statistics with the help of SPSS (version 20) software. The result shows that the students who were being taught via Urdu language as a medium of instruction, their learning level was high because the majority of them performed "excellent" in the exam while the students who were being taught via English language as a medium of instruction, their learning level was moderate because the majority of them performed "good" in the exam. Moreover, the students who were studying in the secondary schools who obeyed educational policy and changed the medium of instruction from Urdu language to English language. When they were teaching via Urdu language before the arrival of educational policy, their students' academic achievement level was high and the majority of the students were performing "excellent", as they followed educational policy and changed the medium of instruction from Urdu language to English language, the learning level of their students decreased because the majority of them performed just "good" in the exam.

**Key Words:** Students' academic achievement, Medium of Instruction (Urdu & English), Secondary School

## I. INTRODUCTION

The educational arena is replete with numerous elements associated with conveying the nature of instruction; language plays a key role in comprehending the educational contents at the place of learning. A lot of developing nations are described for the individuals as a cultural-representative of multilingualism, such polities keep on permitting a solitary language to command the instruction division. Guidance through a language that students don't talk has been designated as, "submersion" (Skutnabb-Kangas 2008), in light of the fact that it is closely resembling holding the students as submerged without showing them how to swim. Language is the mode of guidance which is largely utilized in bestowing guidance in many subjects at any level. The mechanism of guidance has an extremely pivotal job in changing training and making it simple or difficult for an under-study. Language is a significant part of cultural showcase. It is a significant apparatus through which change of social old and new qualities are made simpler. An individual builds up his character with regards to his own social examples, including dialects; obviously, a major part of the socialization procedure comprises of 'learning' (Cuber, 2009). Scholarly accomplishment indicates explicit learning in a particular setting or to be controlled by accomplishment test scores and educator given evaluations and rate in scholastic accomplishment (Kennedy, 2005). As a rule, there are numerous variables which decide understudy's scholarly accomplishment as language is additionally one of them, which influences the exhibition of understudies. As per Arshad (2007), language has an extensive significance that influences instruction in numerous nations. (Muhammad. 2009)

For over six decade-long span and more of its liberation, Pakistan is as yet engaged with the issue of mode of guidance with Urdu (L1) and English (L2) overwhelming right now. The mode of guidance is like a bone of contention in Pakistan. It is proceeding on and can be seen as a force battle between various weight gatherings or the elites and the favorable to elites. (Rahman, 2009). The contrivance of direction is a key for transmission of information and a fountainhead of correspondence by the instructor in the study hall where an educator can discuss successfully with his/her language, motion, and contribute of voice each circumstance. The mechanism of guidance influence under studies' qualities, for example, inspiration towards their learning. In Pakistan, there are diverse local dialects, multicolor customs, verifiable culture and semantic foundation since its commencement. Alongside Urdu and English, other predominant dialects in Pakistan are Punjabi, Sindhi, Pushto, Saraiki, Hindko, and Balochi. (Shaheen & Tariq, 2015). Decent variety of dialects and social contrast arouses the disrupt issue of the mechanism of guidance in Pakistan. Also, Urdu, being the national language, there are some different dialects that are being utilized as the vehicle of guidance in instructive foundations at various degrees of tutoring in the nation. Since the

rise of Pakistan, the administration had attempted to settle the issue of the mode of guidance. In the instructive gathering 1947 and instructive arrangement 1959, it was suggested that commonplace dialects will be the mechanism of guidance at essential level and Urdu will be the vehicle of guidance from rudimentary to optional level. While advanced education would be conferred in English. The training strategy built up in 1992 likewise gave comparative proposals and it was announced that Urdu would be the mechanism of guidance at the basic level. This worldview has been moved from Urdu to English, where it has been suggested that English from 1-14 evaluations would be an obligatory subject. In any case, regardless of Govt. firm stand that English would be the vehicle of guidance; the observational confirmations uncovered that 78% of schools are utilizing Urdu as a mode of guidance and the rest of schools are utilizing English as a mode of guidance. (Sindh Education Census 2005).

In fact, the medium of instruction is a matter of great debate among teachers, educationists, and parents. The majority of teachers and parents say that English should not be the medium of instruction but it should be taught as a subject right from the very beginning of school. After the emergence of Pakistan in 1947, the problem of language arose for teaching as well as for other communications. However, English language occupies a very important place in the educational curricula in Pakistan. In 2009 the Educational-Establishment in Punjab took a territory-wide choice to present English as the mode of guidance in all open segment schools, so English competency would be guaranteed for English as a subject as well as for arithmetic, science, IT, and social examinations. Nisar, and Ahmad, 2011 expressed that:

*"Learning a language and learning in a language are two totally different things and not perceiving the differentiation has an extremely high social expense. I thought of this by and ongoing over a feature that the Punjab Government School Education Department in Pakistan had changed over a huge number of its schools into English medium everywhere throughout the area. The inspiration for the move is expressed to be "an offered to acquire the nature of training government-run schools on a standard with private English medium schools."* (Farooq, & Nafees, 2012)

Along these lines, the issue of the language of guidance, in the same way as other different issues in Pakistan, has been balancing fire since the making of the nation, exchanging to and fro at the impulse of people apparently without a plan of action to any logical proof or basic reasoning. Nobody has registered the costs forced on society by the nonattendance of a rational arrangement throughout 50 years. Not this is another point. Much proof is accessible from our own understanding on the off chance that one wishes to search for it. It was in 1835 that Lord Macaulay ordered the reception of English as the mode of guidance in British India from the 6th standard onwards. Indeed, even at the time this decision was addressed on hypothetical grounds by individual individuals from the Supreme Council of India, who asked how the English would have fared in the event that they had been taught in Arabic as opposed to in Greek and Latin, the old style dialects of Europe. The mechanism of guidance is a dubious issue at all levels, particularly in the social orders where different frameworks of training are followed. In this way, in the previously mentioned point of view the specialist spurred to chip away at Urdu and English as a vehicle of guidance by and large in Pakistan particularly in Punjab. Along these lines, the analyst chose the current subject which is "A comparative study of students' academic achievement through Urdu and English language as medium of instruction at secondary schools (Ahmed, 2011). Let's truth be exposed, the manner of guidance involves extraordinary discussion among instructors, educationists and guardians. Most of the instructors and guardians stated that English ought not to be the mode of guidance however it ought to be educated as a subject right from the earliest starting point of the school. After the development of Pakistan in 1947, the issue of language emerged for instructing just as for other ones. Nonetheless, English language involves a significant spot in the instructive educational programs in Pakistan (Ahmed, 2011).

### **Statement of the Problem**

A comparative study of students' academic achievement through Urdu and English language as medium of instruction at secondary schools

### **Research Objectives**

- i. To compare students' academic achievement who were being taught via Urdu or English as a medium of instruction
- ii. To compare students' academic achievement who changed the medium of instruction from Urdu to English

### **Research Hypothesis**

- i. There is no significant difference in the students' academic achievement who were being taught via Urdu or English as a medium of instruction
- ii. There is no significant difference in the students' academic achievement who changed the medium of instruction from Urdu to English

## II. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

It was descriptive research and survey design in nature. The researcher applied descriptive design in this study because variables for the study medium of instruction in government secondary school was already imposed both medium (Urdu & English) of instruction by Punjab education department. The researcher compared students' academic achievement who were taught via Urdu or English to determine to what extent students' academic achievement effect due to change in medium of instruction.

### Sample and Sampling Technique

Sample for the present study was comprised on 1416 students of the 10<sup>th</sup> class who were selected by applying simple random sampling technique.

### Research Instruments

For this study, the researcher used self-developed questionnaire for the collection of information from the respondents about medium of instruction which were implemented in schools.

### Data Collection and Analysis

For administering the questionnaire, the researcher personally visited the government secondary schools which were selected in the sample for the gleaning data from students. The collected data was arranged and coded. The coded data was entered into computer for analysis. Data was analyzed by applying inferential statistics with the help of SPSS (version 20) software.

## III. RESULTS

### Currently Medium of Instruction (Urdu & English) wise Comparison of Students' academic achievement

The following table discloses that the computed t-value is -1.340 which is less than the table value 1.960 at df (1414) and the computed sig value is .000 which less p= 0.05 level of significance. It shows significant medium of instruction wise difference in students' academic achievement. Moreover, the following table (table 1b) shows what extent students achieved in the exam who were taught via Urdu or English medium.

Table 1a:

Independent sample t-test for the analysis to compare medium of instruction wise students' academic achievement

Medium of Instruction	of N	Mean	Std. D	t	df	Sig.
English	651	31.31	.654	-1.340	1414	.000
Urdu	765	43.26	.691			

Sig= 0.05

### Currently Medium of Instruction wise Comparison of Students' academic achievement

The following discloses that the computed Pearson chi-square value is 14.405 which is greater than the table value 9.488 at df (4) and the computed sig value is .000 which is less than p=0.05 at the level of significance. It shows significant medium of instruction wise difference in the students' academic achievement. Moreover, chi-square table shows that the students who were taught in English medium schools learnt moderately because majority of them performed "good", and the students who were taught in Urdu medium schools learnt highly because the majority of them performed "excellent". It is concluded that Urdu medium of instruction is more effective than the English medium of instruction at secondary school level.

Table 1b:

Chi-square analysis to compare medium of instruction wise students' academic achievement, (English=651, Urdu=765)

Medium of Instruction	Count	Students' academic achievement					Total
		B. Avrg	Avrg	Good	V. good	Excellent	
English	Count	2	38	396	189	26	651
	% within present MoI	.3%	5.8%	60.8%	29.0%	4.0%	100.0%
	% within Learning	22.2%	38.8%	46.5%	46.8%	48.1%	46.0%
	% of Total	.1%	2.7%	28.0%	13.3%	1.8%	46.0%
Urdu	Count	7	28	60	215	455	765
	% within present MoI	.9%	3.7%	7.8%	28.1%	59.5%	100.0%
	% within Learning	77.8%	51.9%	61.2%	53.2%	53.5%	54.0%
	% of Total	.5%	2.0%	4.2%	15.2%	32.1%	54.0%

Medium of Instruction	Count	Students' academic achievement					Total
		B. Avrg	Avrg	Good	V. good	Excellent	
Total	Count	9	66	456	404	481	1416
	% within present Mol	.6%	6.9%	60.1%	28.5%	3.8%	100.0%
	% within Learning	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%
	% of Total	.6%	4.7%	32.2%	28.5%	33.9%	100.0%

*Pearson Chi-Square= 14.405, df=4, sig=.000*

#### Previous and Present Medium of Instruction wise Comparison of Students' Academic Achievement

The following table discloses that the computed t-value is -1.340 which is less than the table value 1.965 at df (412) and the computed sig value is .000 which less p= 0.05 level of significance. It shows significant medium of instruction wise difference in students' academic achievement.

Moreover, the following table (table 2b) shows what extent students performed who were taught via English and Urdu medium of instruction.

*Table 2a:*

*Independent sample t-test for the analysis to compare previous and present medium of instruction wise students' academic achievement, N=413*

Medium of Instruction	Mean	Std. D	t	df	Sig.
Previous Urdu	43.31	1.54	-1.340	412	.000
Present English	29.26	.916			

*Sig= 0.05*

#### Comparison of Change in Medium of Instruction wise Students' academic achievement

The following table discloses comparison of change in the medium of instruction wise difference in students' academic achievement. The secondary schools who adopted Urdu as a medium of instruction before implementation of language policy and English as a medium of instruction after the implementation of language policy, significance difference was found in their students' academic achievement. The secondary schools who adopted Urdu as a medium of instruction before the proper implementation of language policy, their students' academic achievement was high because the majority of them were performing "excellent" and after implementation of language policy and adopt English as a medium of instruction, their students' academic achievement decreased and the majority of them performed "good". It is concluded that the secondary schools who adopt English as a medium of instruction after the implementation of language policy, their students' academic achievement decreased.

*Table 2b:*

*The comparison of previous and present medium of instruction wise students' academic achievement, (N=413)*

Medium of Instruction	Count	Students' academic achievement					Total
		B.Avrg	Avrg	Good	V. good	Excellent	
Previous Urdu	Count	7	47	105	276	629	413
	% within Learning	.9%	4.0%	8.9%	23.4%	53.4%	100.0%
Present English	Count	121	215	455	60	28	413
	% within Learning	10.3%	28.1%	59.5%	7.8%	3.7%	100.0%

#### IV. CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION

This is a descriptive study which is aimed to compare students' academic achievement through Urdu and English language as medium of instruction at secondary schools. To explore it, a quantitative approach was used. Through quantitative responses, major factors affecting academic achievement due to changes in the medium of instruction were identified. The results revealed the responsible factors which effect on academic achievement of the students due to change in the medium of instruction. It is concluded that there were only 38.9% (56) secondary schools who act upon language policy and changed the medium of instruction from Urdu to English. Only schools of the 15.5% (220) students followed language policy and changed the medium of instruction from Urdu to English. Currently medium of instruction (Urdu & English) wise comparison of students' academic achievement shows significant medium of instruction wise difference in students' academic achievement. Moreover, the students who were taught in English medium schools learnt moderately because majority of them performed "good", and the students who

were taught in Urdu medium schools learnt highly because the majority of them performed “excellent”. It is concluded that Urdu medium of instruction is more effective than the English medium of instruction at secondary school level. It was also found that due to change in medium of instruction wise students’ academic achievement. The secondary schools who adopt Urdu as a medium of instruction before implementation of language policy and English as a medium of instruction after the implementation of language policy, significance difference was found in their students’ academic achievement. The secondary schools who adopted Urdu as a medium of instruction before the proper implementation of language policy, their students’ academic achievement was high because the majority of them were performing “excellent” and after implementation of language policy and adopt English as a medium of instruction, their students’ academic achievement decreased and the majority of them performed “good”. It is concluded that the secondary schools who adopted English as a medium of instruction after the implementation of language policy, their students’ academic achievement decreased.

#### REFERENCES

1. Abdullah, M. C., Elias, H., Mahyuddin, R & Uli, J. (2009). Adjustment amongst first year students in a Malaysian University. *European Journal of Social Sciences*, 8(3), 141-147.
2. Adediwura, A. A. & Tayo, B. (2007). Perception of teachers’ knowledge, attitude and Teaching skills as predictor of academic performance in Nigerian secondary schools. *Educational Research and Review*, 2(7), 165-171. Retrieved from <http://www.academicjournals.org>
3. Ahmed I.S, 2011, “issue of medium of instruction in Pakistan”, International Journal of Social Sciences and Education Volume No. 1
4. Andrade, M. S. (2006). International students in English-speaking universities: Adjustment factors. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 5 (131) 341-350,
5. Arshad, M. (1997). A study to compare the achievement of secondary school certificate and higher secondary of Urdu and English medium institutions of Faisalabad City from 1993 to 1996. Islamabad: (Unpublished M. Phil Thesis), Allama Iqbal Open University, Pakistan
6. Bataineh, R. F. (2007). Perceptions of the impact of the use of English as the predominant medium of instruction on Jordanian Economics and Administrative Science students’ academic achievement. *English Language Teaching Forum*, 38 (1), 213-220
7. Benson, C. (2011) Final Report on Bilingual Education. Results of the External Evaluation of the Experiment in Bilingual Schooling, volume No.8
8. Farooq G., Nafees M, 2012, “effects of instructional strategies on academic achievement in a high school general science class”, Pakistan International Journal of Business and Social Science Vol. 3
9. Khan S.B (2009) Ezhar-i-ayan Ki Bayan ki Quwat, Urdu Behtar Ya English, Akhbar-i-Urdu, Muqtdra Quami Zaban, Islamabad
10. Muhammad. S. (2009). A question we are still grappling after 62 years is what should be the medium of instruction in Pakistan
11. Muhammad. S. (2009). *A question we are still grappling after 62 years is what should be the medium of instruction in Pakistan*. Retrieved from <http://research-education-edu.blogspot.com>
12. Nisar, A., & Ahmad, S. I. (2011). Performance of Secondary School Certificate (SSC) Graduates of English and Urdu Medium Schools: A Comparative Study. *Language in India*, 11, 201-205.
13. Rahman, 2009, The Advancement of Teacher work place learning. A professional Development Module for the Recognition and Accreditation of Extended Work Place Learning of Teachers, Centre for Professional Development in education. (pp. 7)
14. Rahman, T. (1999). *Language, Education, and Culture*. Pakistan: Oxford University Press  
Rahman, T. (2002 ). *Language, Ideology and Power: Language learning among Muslims of Pakistan and North India*. Pakistan: Oxford University Press
15. Sabri, H. A. (2007). *Current issues in second language learning of Science*. Istanbul University printing press
16. Samdal, O., Wolsd, B., & Bronis, M. (1999). Relationship between students’ perceptions of the school environment, their satisfaction with school and perceived academic achievement: An international study school effectiveness

- and school improvement. *An International Journal of Research, Policy and Practice*, 10(3), 296 – 320.
17. Sanders, M. G., & Jordan, J. W. (2000). Student-teacher relations and academic achievement in high school. *The Elementary School Journal*, 104(3), 197-212.
  18. Shaheen, T & Tariq S, 2015, "Effects of Change in Medium of Instruction on Academic Achievement of Students: A Qualitative Approach" *Secondary Education Journal* Volume 1, Issue 1, University of the Punjab, Lahore. pp. 31-40
  19. Sindh Education Census (2005), Academy of Education Planning and Management, Ministry of Education, Islamabad, Pakistan